

Cultural Tourism in The Buffalo-Niagara Region:

Developing A Comprehensive Plan

PHASE 1:

Inventory of Cultural Tourism Planning Initiatives
Recommendations for Pursuing a Comprehensive Plan



*A Report commissioned by the Cultural Tourism Steering Committee
of The John R. Oishei Foundation, Buffalo, New York*

April 19, 2002



Institute for Local Governance and Regional Growth
University at Buffalo | The State University of New York
Beck Hall, 3435 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14214-3004 | Phone: 716.829.3777 Fax: 716.829.3776
e-mail: regional-institute@buffalo.edu | web: regional-institute.buffalo.edu



Cultural Tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara Region: Developing a Comprehensive Plan

PHASE 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section I: Overview		Page
1.1	Background	3
1.2	Geographic Scope	3
1.3	Process	4
1.4	Purpose	5
Section II: Inventory of Planning Initiatives		
2.1	Introduction	7
2.2	Completed and Ongoing Cultural Tourism Planning Efforts in the Buffalo-Niagara Region	8
	2.21 <i>Erie and Niagara Counties</i>	
	2.22 <i>Bi-National Niagara Region</i>	
	2.23 <i>Allegany, Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Genesee, Orleans and Wyoming Counties</i>	
	2.24 <i>Southern Ontario</i>	
2.3	External Planning Initiatives	19
	2.31 <i>Erie Canal Corridor and Seaway Trail</i>	
	2.32 <i>New York State and National</i>	
	2.33 <i>Ontario</i>	
2.4	Implications of the Inventory	24
Section III: Recommendations for Pursuing a Comprehensive Plan		
3.1	Introduction	25
3.2	Recommendations	26
	3.21 <i>Organizing a Structure for the Planning Initiative</i>	
	a. <i>Create a coordinating committee</i>	
	b. <i>Review and select recommendations</i>	
	c. <i>Appoint a project manager</i>	
	d. <i>Convene a spring stakeholders meeting and fall conference</i>	
	3.22 <i>Gathering Essential Information</i>	
	a. <i>Inventory and analysis</i>	

- b. *Market analysis*
- 3.23 *Establishing Regional Priorities and the Means by which they are Implemented*
 - a. *Definitions*
 - b. *Goals and timeframes*
 - c. *Asset/resource development*
 - d. *Marketing and promotion*
 - e. *Education and training*
- 3.24 *Funding Sustainability*
 - a. *Encourage more efficient use of existing funds*
 - b. *Identify additional sources of revenue*
- 3.25 *Evaluation and Assessment*
 - a. *Data collection and research*
 - b. *Economic impact analysis*
- 3.26 *Long-term Coordination*

Section IV: Conclusion

4.1	Estimated Costs of Comprehensive Planning Initiative	35
4.2	Buffalo-Niagara at a Fork in the Road	35

Appendices

A.	Sample Letter and Survey Mailed to Umbrella Organizations	39
B.	Mailing List	43
C.	Survey Respondents and Interviewees	49
D.	Inventory Matrix	53
E.	Bibliography	61
F.	Endnotes	64

Section I:

Overview

1.1 Background

This report by the Institute for Local Governance and Regional Growth (“Institute”), University at Buffalo, The State University of New York, was commissioned by The John R. Oishei Foundation (“Foundation”) in January 2002. Representing Phase 1 of an initiative designed to develop a comprehensive plan for cultural tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region of New York State, the report includes two primary aspects: (1) an inventory of past and current planning initiatives focused on some dimension of cultural tourism, and (2) a series of recommendations for organizing and pursuing Phase 2 of the initiative – development and implementation of an effective and enduring comprehensive plan for cultural tourism in the region.

This planning initiative is the result of the efforts of the Cultural Tourism Steering Committee (“CTSC”) established by the Foundation in 2001. It is a deliberate effort to assess the region’s approach to cultural tourism and possible strategies to strengthen the arts and culture sector of the community – and the tourism industry supporting that sector – through improved collaboration and efficiency in the context of a compelling comprehensive plan. This report, representing the preliminary phase of the initiative, is designed to propose a foundation for proceeding with a successful plan.

This Phase 1 report is being presented by the Institute to the Foundation on April 19, 2002. It has been prepared with the kind assistance of a great many people and organizations in the Buffalo-Niagara region with a sincere commitment to a strong future for arts and culture in the community.

1.2 Geographic Scope

For purposes of this Phase 1 report, the “region” contemplated in the inventory and recommendations includes the eight counties of Western New York and the Niagara (southern) portion of the Province of Ontario, Canada. This bi-national region is generically referred to as Buffalo-Niagara. Inevitably, particular emphasis is placed upon



A decision will be required as to the geographic scale of a comprehensive plan in Phase 2.

Erie and Niagara Counties due to the heavy concentration of arts and cultural venues, organizations and events in the metropolitan areas of Buffalo and Niagara Falls.

By its very nature, however, a comprehensive plan for cultural tourism is regional in scope. As discussed in the recommendations that follow, at the outset of Phase 2 a fundamental decision will need to be made whether to include the entire region described above or a subset of that region in the development and implementation of a comprehensive plan.

In any case, even if the primary focus of the plan is Erie and Niagara Counties, the connections to Southern Ontario and the other Western New York counties are of enormous importance in tourism marketing and will need to be taken into consideration.

1.3 Process

The inventory included in this report is an annotated listing of planning initiatives from within and outside of the region that are focused on some aspect of cultural tourism. It is important to distinguish this effort from an inventory of venues, organizations or events. Indeed, the latter model of inventory will be an essential dimension of Phase 2 of this initiative and is included in the recommendations in this report.

The nature of this inventory required that it be compiled primarily by identifying and surveying a range of regional “umbrella entities,” rather than venues or individual organizations. Such umbrella or coordinating entities included arts councils, tourism offices, chambers of commerce, convention and visitors’ bureaus, historical societies and others throughout the Buffalo-Niagara region. Ultimately, a nine-question survey (**see Appendix A**) was developed by the Institute and forwarded to 76 such organizations (**see Appendix B**) in late January and early February 2002. Over the succeeding several weeks, 52 personal interviews and telephone interviews were conducted with representatives from these organizations (**see Appendix C**) to compile comprehensive responses to the survey. In addition, many of the organizations supplied written material such as market reports and tourism plans from earlier or current planning initiatives.

Further research and interviews were conducted toward the goal of annotating and categorizing the listing so as to be of the most value in this Phase 1 report. In all, 57 planning initiatives, both completed and ongoing, comprise the attached inventory that covers approximately the past 15 years. The listing ranges from county-specific tourism plans, to nature and parkland studies, to marketing reports, to comprehensive proposals for arts and culture development in designated areas. It is important to understand that

the inventory is a listing of plans that stakeholders in the region brought to the attention of the Institute during the survey and interviewing process. This inventory, while substantial and hopefully useful, is not necessarily exhaustive of the many planning initiatives during the past decade and a half in the Buffalo-Niagara region.

As discussed in more detail in the introduction to the inventory section of this report, it is believed that this listing of planning initiatives tells an extraordinarily important story about the region. In short, the story is that there are many committed people and organizations pursuing many worthwhile plans, but there is a coordination imperative for the future that is unmistakable if arts and culture are to thrive in the Buffalo-Niagara region.

This coordination imperative was the guiding factor in devising the second portion of this report — the recommendations for developing and implementing a comprehensive plan for cultural tourism. Although research into the fundamental elements of a comprehensive plan and analysis of existing plans from within and outside of the region (**see Appendix E**) were critical aspects of developing the recommendations that follow, the overwhelming need for improved collaboration and efficiency in the region was a constant context for the research and analysis. Again, the interviews conducted as a part of the inventory process were invaluable in fashioning the recommendations for the future. Procedural, structural and substantive considerations are all part of the approach to the Phase 2 recommendations included in this report.

1.4 Purpose

As understood from the preliminary discussions with the Foundation and CTSC, this comprehensive planning initiative is designed to assist the region in achieving excellence in maintaining and nurturing the arts and culture dimension of our society and in supporting and marketing that critical sector. Excellence is indeed the necessary standard for a sector that has such a profound effect on our quality of life and such a dramatic impact on our economy. Cultural tourism, with the unusual dual effect of enriching our spirits and strengthening our economy, is one of the fastest growing sectors of the tourism industry and is assisting regions across the nation in drawing visitors, attracting and retaining companies, creating economic development opportunities, leveraging educational programming and increasing community pride.

It is demonstrably true that the Buffalo-Niagara region has an extraordinary array of artistic, cultural and historic assets that provide an extremely strong basis on which to build an effective and lasting cultural tourism industry. From diverse museums and theaters, to Niagara Falls, to historic parks and architecture, to thrilling musical and other artistic resources, this region has the ability to aggressively compete for a market share of the tourism dollar. Moreover, the Buffalo-Niagara region has a spellbinding story to tell – a story of a robust and diverse history as an industrial powerhouse, a place of promise for immigrants, a collection of geologic wonders and a diverse fabric of peoples.

It is similarly true, however, that the region has yet to capitalize on these exceptional resources and has a long way to go to achieve its potential as a world-class tourist destination. An independent study¹ recently reported that only 8.7 percent of tourists visiting the greater Niagara region included cultural activities in their itinerary – a stark contrast to the national trend.² Despite the region's wealth of assets, numerous planning initiatives, hardworking professionals, committed stakeholders, substantial funding and recent collaborative initiatives, the cultural tourism approach in the region remains largely fractured, inefficient and ineffective.

It is hoped that an understanding of the existing planning initiatives included in the following inventory and a commitment to the goals of the following recommendations will result in the development and implementation of a compelling, enduring and coordinated approach to cultural tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region.

Section II:

Inventory of Planning Initiatives

2.1 Introduction

It is axiomatic that previous and current planning efforts within the region on topics related to cultural tourism should be identified and understood as a prerequisite for moving forward with a new comprehensive planning initiative. To that end, an annotated inventory of 57 planning initiatives in the Buffalo-Niagara region, covering roughly the past 15 years, has been compiled.

As outlined in the Overview, there is no assertion here that the following inventory is exhaustive of each and every plan that could arguably be included in this cultural tourism roster. This list represents those initiatives that are relevant to the cultural tourism focus of this report and were identified by the Institute as a result of research, a written survey of 76 umbrella organizations, and a series of 52 interviews. Clearly, in many cases, judgment calls were required regarding inclusion of a particular plan. A traffic plan, for example, is not focused on the cultural tourism topic *per se*, but perhaps has some distinctive impact upon cultural tourism development in the region.

Each entry in the inventory is organized, to the extent possible and as available information has allowed, so as to address the substance of the initiative, the date the project was initiated, the completion or anticipated completion date and the project's primary partners and sources of funding. The inventory is structured into two sections: (1) completed and ongoing efforts in the Buffalo-Niagara region, separated into Erie and Niagara Counties; Bi-National Niagara Region; Allegany, Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Genesee, Orleans and Wyoming Counties, and Southern Ontario, and (2) past and present planning initiatives external to the region, which comprise the Erie Canal Corridor and Seaway Trail; New York State and National, and Ontario.

It will be seen that this inventory reveals both exceedingly positive and negative characteristics of cultural tourism planning in the Buffalo-Niagara region. On the positive side, an enormous volume of valuable work has been accomplished and is currently under way on topics of importance to arts and culture and cultural tourism. On the negative side, much of this work is disconnected, overlapping and inefficient. This dilemma has implications pertaining not only to the substantive strength of the entire planning picture for cultural tourism, but also to the inefficient nature or use of funding for planning initiatives. On balance, the current picture supports the conclusion that the potential for

deliberate, practical progress is very great and that the prospective value of cooperating in a comprehensive plan is unmistakable.

2.2 Completed and Ongoing Cultural Tourism Planning Efforts in the Buffalo-Niagara Region

(Planning initiatives are listed alphabetically within each category)

2.21 Erie and Niagara Counties

- *A Blueprint for Marketing Niagara County as a Visitor Destination*
Prepared by OCG, a Florida-based tourism consulting firm, under contract with Niagara University, this report³ sets forth a plan for marketing Niagara County as a visitors' destination. The first part of the report examines Niagara County's strengths, weaknesses and opportunities for product development, marketing, visitor experience and industry/community relationships, while Part II presents a blueprint for billing Niagara County as a visitors' destination. The plan calls for the creation of a new marketing organization and offers recommendations for the entity's mission, objectives, organizational structure, governance and operational imperatives. The blueprint also outlines strategies for marketing, developing product and infrastructure, increasing visitation, securing funding, conducting research and building community support. A consolidation team, formed following the release of this report in early 2002, will work with OCG to implement the plan. State funds secured by New York State Senator George Maziarz have supported this initiative.
- *Buffalo Inner Harbor Project*
This is a major public project designed to revitalize Buffalo's waterfront and assist in improving the regional economy, including the tourism industry. The plan has several aspects, including the creation of a Hero's Walk and wharf, movement of navel ships to enhance the view of the waterfront, excavation of two new canal slips to accommodate tourist and recreational ships and the development of a naval museum, a mixed-use waterfront building and a waterfront plaza for public events. Empire State Development is managing the project's design and construction. New York State and the federal government are funding the project, although Erie County and the City of Buffalo have committed some funding for project revisions. While construction is under way, the project's completion is still several years off.
- *Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau's 2002 Marketing Plan*
This marketing plan⁴ reaffirms the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau's ongoing effort to increase convention and tourism business and improve the image of the Buffalo-Niagara region. Enhancing cultural tourism marketing initiatives in the region is a major goal of the plan. The plan recommends

collaboration between the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County and the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau to develop and promote such initiatives as a means of achieving that goal. The development of consumer packages, an online calendar of cultural events, brochures with themed itineraries and cooperative marketing opportunities are among other plan highlights. It also proposes the coordination of a travel showcase, informational exchange meetings for cultural and tourism representatives and a training program for frontline hotel staff.

- *Buffalo Niagara Cultural Tourism Marketing Program*
A newly formed cultural tourism committee at the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau is developing a cultural tourism marketing plan for the Buffalo-Niagara region. The committee will recommend policies, broad strategies and priorities for cultural tourism development. It will attempt to ensure that initiatives are coordinated and that the promotion of cultural tourism is integrated within the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau's overall marketing plan. While this planning effort is under way, it is in its initial stages. The Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau is funding the committee's work.
- *A Canal Conversation: A Community Forum on Buffalo's Inner Harbor Development and Erie Canal*
A community forum held in September 2000, *A Canal Conversation* convened a diverse group of experts to discuss the commercial slip and Erie Canal as well as Buffalo's potential for "heritage development." In addition to outlining the prospects for heritage tourism and development, the experts identified key issues to be resolved and highlighted roadblocks to that end. A transcript of the conference proceedings is contained in *A Canal Conversation: Buffalo, New York*.⁵ The forum was planned and promoted by a 24-member conference steering committee. It was presented with the financial support of The National Trust for Historic Preservation, The Baird Foundation, The Paul J. Koessler Foundation, The Western New York Foundation, Fleet Bank, N.A. and Daemen College. Publication support was provided by The Koessler and Baird Foundations and Downtown Buffalo 2002.
- *Cultural Alliance of Niagara*
More than a dozen arts and cultural organizations have united to form the Cultural Alliance with the intention of combining resources for marketing, promotion, fundraising and lobbying. The efforts of the Cultural Alliance are funded by the member organizations, which include the Amherst Museum; Aquarium of Niagara; Artpark; Carnegie Art Center; Castellani Art Museum of Niagara University; Herschell Carrousel Factory Museum; Kenan Center; Lewiston Council on the Arts; Niagara Aerospace Museum; Niagara Art Council; Niagara Power Project Power Vista; Niagara County Historical Society Inc.; Old Fort Niagara; Historic Riviera Theater and Schoelkopf Geological Museum. Some of these organizations are participating in an economic impact study being conducted by Americans for the Arts. For more information on this national initiative, see *Arts and Economic Prosperity* in this inventory.

- *Cultural Tourism: A Discussion Paper With Respect to an Initiative For the Greater Buffalo Area*
 This paper presents observations about the cultural tourism industry in Greater Buffalo as well as suggestions for future strategies. Ted Pietrzak, executive director of the Burchfield-Penney Art Center and Chair of the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau's Cultural Tourism Committee, prepared the report in 1998. According to the paper, Buffalo is rich in cultural resources but most cultural organizations see tourism as a low priority. Moreover, short-term returns almost always overshadow long-term views. In addition to proposing a number of marketing initiatives, the paper recommends that a special task force be established to develop a cultural tourism plan for the area. The task force would be composed of representatives from area cultural organizations, the Arts Council, Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau, Buffalo Niagara Partnership and an elected representative. In addition to developing a plan, the committee would be responsible for preparing a budget, retaining qualified staff, developing marketing initiatives and evaluating the program's results.
- *Cultural Tourism Report for Erie County*
 This report was presented to the Erie County Legislature in 1998. It was prepared by Deborah Ann Trimble, Executive Director of the Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy, while she was working at the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County. A draft of the report — the only version the Institute was able to obtain — examines the definition of cultural tourism as well as national trends within the cultural tourism industry. It presents successful cultural tourism initiatives from outside the region and provides a brief assessment of this region's cultural tourism assets. Broad strategies for strengthening the cultural tourism industry in Erie County, as well as the need for structure, timelines, budgets and measurements of success, are also discussed in the draft.
- *Important Bird Area Branding and Promotion*
 In 1996 the Niagara River became internationally identified as an Important Bird Area. The Buffalo Audubon Society, in partnership with the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau and the New York State Department of Parks, Recreation & Historic Preservation, is working to develop and market a birding corridor to coincide with the internationally recognized Important Bird Area. As part of this branding and promotional effort, interpretive signage has been posted along the birding corridor. In addition, the Buffalo Audubon Society has partnered with the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau to produce *Nature Tourism in Buffalo Niagara*, a brochure promoting bird watching and nature trails in Erie and Niagara Counties. A grant from the Community Foundation of Greater Buffalo is supporting production of the brochure.
- *Initiative to Get Buffalo Moving*
 The events of September 11, 2001 precipitated decreased arts and cultural funding as well as reduced tourism activity. In response, representatives from the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau, the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County, as well as area cultural organizations, formed an ad hoc committee to

promote the arts, culture and other attractions within the region. They have proposed a multi-year marketing effort that will enhance and complement the marketing efforts of the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County, Buffalo Niagara Enterprise, Buffalo Niagara Partnership and the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau. The committee produced *Buffalo Cultural Events*, a calendar of cultural events for winter 2002. Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau and Empire State Development are funding the committee's work.

- *The John R. Oishei Foundation Cultural Tourism Initiative*
In fall 2001, The John R. Oishei Foundation convened an ad hoc Cultural Tourism Steering Committee to explore the coordination of existing cultural tourism planning efforts and develop a comprehensive, long-term cultural tourism plan for the region. The Cultural Tourism Steering Committee, co-chaired by Muriel Howard and Erland Kailbourne, retained the Institute for Local Governance and Regional Growth to complete Phase 1 of a two-phase process. Phase 1, which has culminated in this report, consists of an inventory of past and current cultural tourism planning initiatives, as well as recommendations for proceeding with a comprehensive cultural tourism plan.
- *Memorandum of Understanding Regarding the Establishment of a Regional Tourism Program*
A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)⁶ was drafted in fall 2001 by Erie County; the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County; the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau; Niagara County; Niagara Council of the Arts and Empire State Development. The parties agreed to work together to develop and implement a Regional Cultural Tourism Program. This initiative is founded upon the recognized need to develop, coordinate and implement a regional cultural tourism and marketing plan for the Buffalo-Niagara region. In support of the MOU a draft outline of a three-year cultural tourism plan — focusing on program structure, education, marketing and data tracking — was developed. A more comprehensive, three-year tactical plan was subsequently drafted. For more information on this plan, see *Regional Cultural Tourism Program: Tactical Plan – 2001-2003* in this inventory.
- *New Plan for a Bright Future: City of Lackawanna Comprehensive Plan*
This plan, prepared in 2000 by Peter J. Smith & Company Inc. and URS Greiner Woodward-Clyde, outlines a strategy for promoting cultural tourism in the City of Lackawanna. The strategy features the development of a brochure and tour packages, as well as the designation of a Civil War Museum and other significant sites as historic landmarks. Last year the City of Lackawanna adopted the plan, which was developed with input from the community as well as a steering committee composed of representatives of the City of Lackawanna and the business sector. A community development block grant from the Erie County Department of Environment & Planning supported the plan's development. A strategic area study, currently being conducted by Allee King Rosen & Fleming Inc., will build on this work. For more information on this latter initiative, see *South Park/Botanical Gardens/Our Lady of Victory (OLV) Strategic Area Plan* in this inventory.

- *Olmsted Crescent Marketing Plan*
 The objective of this plan is to brand and market the Olmsted Crescent area, which encompasses 10 of Buffalo's significant cultural attractions. These include the Albright-Knox Art Gallery; Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society; Burchfield-Penney Art Center; Buffalo Zoological Gardens; Shakespeare in Delaware Park; Buffalo Museum of Science; Tri-Main Center; Forest Lawn Cemetery; Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy and Frank Lloyd Wright's Darwin D. Martin House Complex. This marketing initiative features a cultural pass offering seven-day access to attractions in the Crescent, a brochure and shuttle bus service to the Crescent. The Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy is the lead partner of the initiative, which is being funded by a Cultural Tourism Initiative grant from the Arts & Business Council Inc. and the New York State Council on the Arts. A grant from The Baird Foundation and \$500 contributions from each of the 10 organizations located within the Crescent are also supporting the program.
- *Olmsted Parks System Restoration Plan*
 The Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy will soon be developing a 20-year restoration plan for the Olmsted Parks system. The Central Park Conservancy, which developed a similar restoration plan for New York City's Central Park, will act as the project consultant. The plan will provide a framework for supporting and coordinating a variety of developmental and restorative initiatives such as the creation of a tunnel, bike path and cultural and educational corridor. The plan will also be coordinated with the Scajaquada study and potential expansions at the Buffalo Museum of Science. The entire planning process is expected to take 12-18 months and will begin in late spring 2002. Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy, which has received funding from foundations and other private sources, is supporting the plan's development. Erie County also has committed some funding for the project.
- *Regional Cultural Tourism Program - Cultural Tourism Retreat 2001*
 In July 2001, the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County sponsored a one-day retreat as part of its Regional Cultural Tourism Program in order to stimulate dialogue among area arts, cultural and tourism organizations. Representatives from more than three-dozen organizations were invited to attend. Topics addressed included cultural tourism planning goals and priorities as well as strategies and timeframes for building a cultural tourism marketing strategy for the Buffalo-Niagara region. Trudy McNulty, President of Tourism Development Associates, led the retreat discussions. A grant from the National Endowment for the Arts funded the retreat.
- *Regional Cultural Tourism Program: Tactical Plan 2001-2003*
 This plan⁷ presents the objectives, strategies and action steps that the Regional Cultural Tourism Program, directed by Patrick Keyes, proposes to pursue through 2003. The program establishes four goals: (1) build new and improved lines of communication between cultural and hospitality industries, (2) develop and

nurture comprehensive and consistent promotional strategies, (3) support and enhance the tourism industry's best practices through the development of marketing knowledge, and (4) deliver quantifiable results and data. For each goal, the plan outlines several strategies. Action steps, potential partners, costs, timelines and expected outcomes are identified for each strategy. The total cost of implementing this three-year program is approximately \$620,900. For more information on the creation of the Regional Cultural Tourism Program, see *Memorandum of Understanding Regarding the Establishment of a Regional Tourism Program* in this inventory.

- *A Report on Regional Tourism for Western New York State*
This report⁸ articulates opinions and ideas in order to spur discussion about, and catalyze planning for, tourism development in the region. The report was prepared by Trahan, Burden & Charles Inc., a Baltimore-based consulting firm, at the request of the Western New York Economic Development Corporation. The geographic focus of the report is Erie, Niagara and Chautauqua Counties. Among the issues addressed include potential opportunities, information and signage, literature and brochures, public-private partnerships, marketing, organization and budgeting. The report was submitted to The Western New York Economic Development Corporation in 1987.
- *Return of Vehicular Traffic to Main Street Project*
This is an initiative to open up Main Street in Downtown Buffalo to automobile traffic. The City of Buffalo — in partnership with the Niagara Frontier Transportation Authority (NFTA), Erie County, Buffalo Place Inc. and the New York State Department of Transportation — is coordinating the project. The initiative is designed to stimulate economic development and improve the quality of life in downtown Buffalo. An engineering feasibility study, conducted in 1999, determined that it is possible to add automobiles and parking to Main Street while retaining Metro Rail operations. In August 2001, the City of Buffalo, Buffalo Place Inc., NFTA and Greater Buffalo Niagara Regional Transportation Council analyzed the benefits of adding cars to Main Street and made recommendations on how to proceed. Their analysis and recommendations are contained in *Cars Sharing Main Street: Staff Analysis*.⁹ The report recommends that an environmental review be conducted and used as a means to build public consensus on a favored design alternative. That review process is under way.
- *Scajaquada Corridor Study*
This study is based on the premise that the Scajaquada is “not in harmony with adjacent land uses including educational and cultural institutions.”¹⁰ The roadway covers a 3.6-mile stretch from the Niagara Section of the New York State Thruway to the Kensington Expressway. This corridor, which has periods of congestion, as well as accident problems, is partly within the boundaries of Delaware Park. The study examines potential transportation improvements, as well as their impacts, and proposes to create “a unifying facility that enhances the ambience of the surrounding historic, cultural and educational environment.”¹¹ The City of Buffalo — in partnership with the New York State Department of

Transportation, Erie County and an Advisory Group composed of representatives from various interested agencies — is leading the study. A March 2003 completion date has been set.

- *South Park/Botanical Gardens/Our Lady of Victory (OLV) Strategic Area Plan*
This is a strategic development and preservation plan for the South Park/Botanical Garden/OLV region. This area, proximate to the historic Basilica, the Frederick Law Olmsted-designed South Park and the Botanical Gardens, has the potential to serve as a significant cultural and heritage tourist destination, according to this plan. The plan intends to create a framework for addressing the area's tourism, community and economic/business deficiencies. It is also designed to promote and accommodate increased visitation due to the expected canonization of Father Nelson H. Baker, as well as planned upgrades to the Botanical Gardens and South Park. The plan will set forth specific recommendations and detailed strategies. Such recommendations will be based on an ongoing study that is to examine issues such as projected visitation and related demand (e.g., for hotels and retail), parking needs, traffic circulation, neighborhood safety, streetscape and public amenity enhancements and protection of neighborhood integrity and livability. A completion date for the study has been set for spring 2002. Allee King Rosen & Fleming Inc. is developing the plan. The Lackawanna Community Development Corporation, Erie County and a New York State Quality Communities Grant are financially backing the plan. The partners in this effort include the Cities of Buffalo and Lackawanna; OLV Basilica; Buffalo and Erie County Botanical Gardens; Lackawanna Community Development Corporation; Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau; Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy; Catholic Health System; Second Ward Alliance; Lackawanna Chamber of Commerce; Lackawanna Junior Chamber; Lackawanna Empire Zone; The Front Page; New York State Senator William T. Stachowski; New York State Assemblyman Brian Higgins; New York State Assemblyman Richard A. Smith and Erie County Legislator Edward J. Kuwik.
- *Southtowns Masterplan*
The towns of Boston, Evans, Hamburg, Orchard Park and West Seneca are currently developing a plan to stimulate economic development within the five-town area. Cultural tourism is the focus of one section of the plan. Other municipalities and/or collaborations among municipalities in the Buffalo-Niagara region also have master plans under way.
- *Summer of Monet Campaign*
The Summer of Monet Campaign was a major collaborative planning effort that convened leaders from area businesses, foundations and tourism agencies in order to capitalize on the influx of tourists into Buffalo for the Albright-Knox Art Gallery's *Monet at Giverny* exhibit. Approximately 70 not-for-profit cultural organizations showcased activities during the summer of 1999 as part of this initiative, which featured a cultural events brochure and hotel/cultural packages. The Albright-Knox Art Gallery was the effort's lead partner. Other partners included the Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County and the Buffalo Niagara

Convention & Visitors Bureau. Financial supporters included The John R. Oishei Foundation, Crowley Webb & Associates, the Community Foundation of Greater Buffalo, The Baird Foundation and M&T Bank.

2.22 *Bi-National Niagara Region*

- *Bi-National Marketing Plan*
A bi-national tourism steering committee composed of four tourism industry representatives from each side of the border is continuing the work started at the tourism session of the 2001 Pataki-Harris Summit. The committee has developed a marketing plan that contains recommendations on how to market and promote tourism resources located in the bi-national region. Although the report has been completed, it is still under review and has not been released to the public. For more information on the Pataki-Harris Summit and the formation of the bi-national cultural steering committee, see *Pataki-Harris Summit* in this inventory.
- *Binational Niagara Tourism Alliance - Binational Project*
The 250-member Binational Niagara Tourism Alliance represents arts, cultural, heritage, accommodations and tourism organizations from both the public and private sector. They are working together to develop the bi-national Niagara region as an international tourism destination. They have developed a framework that focuses on products, models, measurements, packaging, marketing, promotion, investment and infrastructure redevelopment. Their focus in 2001 was on collaborative marketing strategies, while infrastructure development is their focus for 2002. To this end, the Alliance supports the use of the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation's Premier-ranked Tourist Destination framework. In January 2002, a meeting of bi-national partners was held in St. Catharines to determine the level of interest in applying this model to the bi-national region. The attendees agreed to work together to utilize the model. For more information on this latter initiative, see *Create a Binational Tourism Destination Initiative* in this inventory.
- *Binational Niagara Tourism Alliance: Tourism Training Workshops and Conference*
The Binational Niagara Tourism Alliance is launching a series of tourism training programs to be held in April and May 2002. They will feature six training workshops and a tourism training conference. The workshops are designed to train partners to become tourism organizations. Topics to be covered include entry into the tourism business, partnerships, packaging and networking. A one-day conference in May 2002 will build on the groundwork laid in the workshops. Individual and panel presentations will address packaging and costing, tourism trends, relationships with the travel trade and media outlets as well as the use of the Internet as a retail sales tool and information source. Jill Vandal, Principal of The Tourism Company, will facilitate the workshops. The Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation has provided funding for these developmental sessions.

- *Create a Binational Tourism Destination Initiative*
 This is a community-supported initiative to apply the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation's Premier-ranked Tourist Destination model to the bi-national Niagara region, an area encompassing Erie and Niagara Counties and Southern Ontario, for the purpose of this study. This initiative was launched in January 2002 with an information sharing session in the City of St. Catharines. The meeting's bi-national attendees agreed to collaborate to employ this model for the bi-national region. A follow-up meeting was hosted by Erie County in February 2002. Discussions focused on logistical issues such as manpower, funding and resource points. A preliminary list of key advisory committee members was also compiled. The Buffalo partners agreed to host the next meeting, which was scheduled for March 25, 2002. Although funding for this initiative has not yet been established, an inventory of the region's tourism assets, as well as a tourism labor market study, are already under way. The entire planning process is expected to take approximately 18 months. For more information on the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation's model, see *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: A Self-guided Workbook* in this inventory.
- *Cross-Border Cultural Tourism – A Two Way Street*
 This report¹² provides facts and data on cultural tourism activity and cross-border flows between Canada and the United States. It was prepared by Research Resolutions & Consulting Ltd. and presented at a November 17, 2001 roundtable discussion on *Cross-Border Tourism and the Hospitality Industries in Canada, the United States, and Mexico: Comparative Advantages and Disadvantages in an Atmosphere of Terror*. The Department of Canadian Heritage financially supported the report, which presents several sets of data, including the total number of overnight visitors, their points of origin, sought-after cultural experiences and activities and travel group size. It also includes visitor demographic data such as age, gender, education and household income.
- *Niagara Park, North America: A Binational Strategy for Attracting the World*
 This bi-national tourism report¹³ was prepared in 1995 by the First-Year Graduate Planning Workshop at the University at Buffalo's School of Architecture and Planning. Presented to a bi-national group of advisors, the report examines issues in the Niagara Falls region such as tourism development, product development, transportation and accessibility, thematic journeys, implementing strategies and models of bi-national cooperation. The report recommends better coordination among existing, fragmented planning efforts between and within the United States and Canada. It contains a list of large-scale bi-national cooperative efforts from elsewhere in North America that could serve as precedents for this region.
- *Pataki-Harris Summit*
 New York State Governor George Pataki and Ontario Premier Michael Harris signed an agreement on June 26, 2001 to cooperate to increase bi-national trade and tourism. A bi-national tourism steering committee was created to continue the work begun at the Summit's tourism session. Under its mandate, the committee will develop a bi-national marketing approach to benefit both Ontario

and New York State. The committee is also responsible for monitoring and endorsing, for the purpose of funding, key bi-national tourism initiatives. For more information on the work of this committee, see *Bi-National Marketing Plan* in this inventory.

- *Rethinking Niagara*
This is a bi-national collaboration organized by the Urban Design Project at the University at Buffalo and Toronto's Waterfront Regeneration Trust. Its focus is developing cultural and heritage tourism in the bi-national Niagara region. Through a series of publications and meetings and conferences beginning in 1999, *Rethinking Niagara* has drawn attention to, and outlined the possibilities for, cultural tourism in the bi-national region. The initiative has gathered wide support for a coordinated effort to put heritage tourism at the top of a bi-national regional development agenda. A forum held in October 2001 drew approximately 200 leaders from government, business, arts, historic preservation and education organizations. A summary of the first two forums, including presentations, can be found in *Rethinking the Niagara Frontier: A report on the continuing bi-national forum*.¹⁴ The work has garnered support from the Margaret L. Wendt Foundation as well as the Donner Canadian Foundation. Other American financial supporters include the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency; German Marshall Fund of the United States; Niagara Falls Redevelopment Corporation; Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau; Center for Community Economic Development Through Hospitality and Tourism at Niagara University; City of Niagara Falls, New York; Maid of the Mist Corporation and Mid-Atlantic Regional Humanities Center. Additional Canadian financial partners include the Province of Ontario, Niagara Economic and Tourism Corporation, Canada Lands Company and Niagara Parks Commission.

2.23 *Allegany, Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Genesee, Orleans and Wyoming Counties*

- *1999 Chautauqua County Tourism Conversion and Marketing Study*
This marketing study¹⁵ examines Chautauqua County's tourism industry and tourism potential, as well as the effectiveness of the Chautauqua County Visitors' Bureau's marketing strategies. The report was prepared by a group of marketing students at the State University of New York, College at Fredonia at the request of the Chautauqua County Visitors' Bureau [CCVB]. Data were collected from surveys mailed to persons who requested visitor information from the CCVB during 1997. The indicators presented and analyzed include: the number of respondents that chose to visit Chautauqua County; visit purpose; influences on the decision to visit; usefulness of travel literature; number of prior visits; possibility of future visits; types of attractions and activities visited; household income; age; state of residence; month of travel; average daily expenditures; length of visit; type of lodging and travel-party size.

- *Allegany County Arts and Cultural Tourism Initiative*
 The Allegany County Office of Tourism and Culture is working on a countywide plan to promote cultural tourism. The initiative includes the compilation of an inventory of arts and cultural assets in Allegany County. The County's Office of Tourism and Culture will then consider options for packaging, marketing and promoting the assets. The creation of a county arts council — a not-for-profit organization to function independently from the county — will also be considered. The plan will build on the *Chautauqua, Cattaraugus, Allegany Regional Tourism Initiative* — a marketing plan for the tri-county region that is under way. Allegany County is funding this initiative.
- *Chautauqua, Cattaraugus, Allegany Regional Tourism Initiative*
 The Chautauqua County Visitors' Bureau, Cattaraugus County Department of Economic Development, Planning, & Tourism, Allegany County Tourism and the Ellicottville Chamber of Commerce initiated this effort to examine the tourism marketing needs of Chautauqua, Cattaraugus and Allegany Counties. The project team has hired two tourism research and marketing firms to carry out the study. The assessment portion of the plan is expected to be complete by mid-2002. The report is to include marketing recommendations based on consumer research and a new brand name for the tri-county region. Previously collected market data as well as a complete inventory and analysis of the region's tourism assets will determine the marketing recommendations. The lead partners, area arts councils, businesses and St. Bonaventure University are funding the initiative.
- *Dunkirk Community Challenge*
 This community initiative was developed approximately five years ago to address issues such as the lack of cultural tourism facing the City of Dunkirk. Task forces were created to identify problem areas and establish priorities for tackling these challenges.
- *Genesee County Arts Economic Impact Study*
 The Genesee County Parks, Recreation and Culture Focus Group — one of ten focus groups appointed by the Genesee County Legislature to implement the County's comprehensive plan — is working with a graduate student from the University at Buffalo's Department of Planning to conduct an economic impact study of the arts industry in Genesee County. The study will measure direct, indirect and induced impacts. The study, expected to be complete by summer 2002, is designed to measure the significance of the arts industry in Genesee County. It is hoped that the data will support the development of a county cultural plan. The lead partners in this initiative include the Genesee County Parks, Recreation and Culture Focus Group and the University at Buffalo.
- *Genesee Orleans Regional Arts Council Strategic Plan*
 The Genesee Orleans Regional Arts Council is working with a consultant from Troy, New York, to develop a comprehensive arts and cultural plan for Genesee and Orleans Counties. The plan will contain goals, strategies and implementing

tasks for arts and cultural resource development, marketing and data collection. An August 2002 completion date has been set. A grant from the Rochester Area Community Foundation is supporting the initiative.

2.24 Southern Ontario

- *Ontario's Niagara Parks: Planning the second century*
This 14-year-old report¹⁶ sets forth a 100-year vision, a 20-year plan and an immediate five-year action plan for developing and promoting Ontario's Niagara Parks as a tourist destination. Prepared for the Niagara Parks Commission by Moriyama & Teshima Planners Limited, the plan addresses marketing, transportation, facility upgrades, improved visitor experience, planning, programming and funding, among other issues. A host of public and private organizations participated in this planning initiative, including the Niagara Parks Commission; the Ontario Ministry of Municipal Affairs, Plan Administration Branch; Ontario Ministry of Culture and Communications; the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation; Parks Canada; Ontario Hydro Energy; Niagara Frontier Region of the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation; Regional Municipality of Niagara and many private tourism organizations.

2.3 External Planning Initiatives

2.31 Erie Canal Corridor and Seaway Trail

- *Erie Canalway National Heritage Corridor Management Plan*
In December 2002, the United States Congress authorized the creation of an Erie Canalway National Heritage Corridor Commission. The Commission will have 27 members, which were to be appointed by March 2002. Under its mandate, the Commission has three years to develop a management plan for the Erie Canalway National Heritage Corridor. The management plan is expected to identify, develop, promote and preserve the historical, natural and cultural resources of the Erie Canalway and to develop partnerships for these purposes. There will be various federal, state and local partners in this effort, including the National Park Service and the New York State Canal Corporation. A \$10 million federal appropriation will fund the Commission's work.
- *Seaway Trail Inc. Action Plan II*
This management plan¹⁷ for the Seaway Trail was completed in 1996 and sequels the Seaway Trail Action Plan of 1989. Although it reaffirms the goals contained in the 1989 plan — one of which was to grow the tourism industry throughout the Seaway Trail region — this plan also employs experience and market data to

update strategies for achieving these goals. The plan addresses organization, finance, planning, operations and marketing. The Seaway Trail Action Plan Committee completed the plan. A Federal Highway Administration grant administered through the New York State Department of Transportation to Seaway Trail Inc. supported this initiative.

- *Tourism Development Plan for the New York State Seaway Trail*
This development plan¹⁸ identifies the tourism resources, markets and zone characteristics of the New York State Seaway Trail. The report, completed in 1988, also recommends a framework for development. A summary of this development plan can be found in *Seaway Trail Action Plan*.¹⁹ The plan's goals include increasing economic development and tourism throughout the Seaway Trail region, protecting and enhancing its resources and developing the Seaway Trail as a high-quality recreation and vacation experience. The plan also explores issues of economic development, planning, operations and marketing. Seaway Trail Inc. was the plan's lead partner.
- *Western Erie Canal Corridor - Heritage Area Management Plan: A Celebration of Our Legacy. A Blueprint for the Present*
The Western Erie Canal Heritage Corridor Planning Commission is developing a management plan for the Erie Canal Corridor, which runs through Erie, Orleans, Monroe, Niagara and Wayne Counties. A draft outline of the plan has been completed. The plan purports to increase economic and tourism development along the Erie Canal while preserving its historically significant features. Among the issues addressed in the draft are marketing and public outreach, interpretation, opportunities for business and tourism development, preservation and funding. The plan's completion is expected by July 2003. As part of the plan, the Commission is compiling an inventory of historic and cultural resources in select communities along the Erie Canal Corridor, including Lockport, Middleport and Buffalo's historic First Ward. Assisting the Commission in the development of the management plan are approximately 30 partners from government, business, culture, historic preservation and education organizations. New York State, which created the Western Erie Canal Heritage Corridor Planning Commission in 1999, is funding the initiative.

2.32 *New York State and National*

- *2002 New York State Visual Arts Branding and Promotion Program*
This program is designed to test a coordinated statewide marketing campaign that brands New York State as a first-class destination for the visual arts. It is designed to encourage travel to art museums throughout the State, enhance upstate/downstate partnerships, diversify visitor profiles and increase visitor attendance. The marketing campaign will commence May 2002 and continue through October 2002. The program will feature a frequent visitors program, travel packages and itineraries and travel getaway ideas. Outcome data will be collected to evaluate the program's success. The New York State Division of

Tourism is leading the project, in partnership with art museums, tourism agencies and other organizations across the State, including the Albright-Knox Art Gallery, Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau and Niagara Falls Convention & Visitors Bureau. The State is also funding the program.

- *Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations - Planning and Training Meetings*
The Alliance sponsors six regional planning and training meetings each year. The meetings, hosted at regional arts councils, convene representatives from arts and cultural organizations across New York State to address the state of the industry as well as funding and training issues. The Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations funds the sessions.
- *Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations - Annual Arts Conference*
The Alliance also coordinates and funds an annual arts conference. The topics of planning and vision were addressed at the 2000 conference, mediated by a tourism consultant. Professional development, technology and marketing were the subjects of the 2001 conference. The discussions at the two conferences were detailed in a report — *Prelude to the Development of a Statewide Marketing Plan*. A marketing consultant and leaders from statewide arts and cultural organizations produced the report, which is not available to the public.
- *Arts and Economic Prosperity*
Initiated by Americans for the Arts, this study will measure the economic impact of the not-for-profit arts industry, both nationally and in select communities. In Western New York, Niagara County has been selected for the study, which is to examine the number of fulltime jobs supported, household income received, and state and local revenue generated by the not-for-profit arts industry. These figures will be based on survey data collected within the selected communities. In order to participate in this study, partner communities were required to provide Americans for the Arts with a comprehensive list of not-for-profit arts organizations within their communities. In addition, each community was required to submit an organizational expenditure survey of not-for-profit arts organizations and conduct 750 audience expenditure surveys at 15 different events over a 12-month period. Americans for the Arts provided the surveys along with training and technical assistance. The national study's release is expected in July 2002. Community reports should be available the following month.
- *Cultural Tourism Initiative Grants Program*
This program is funded by the New York State Council on the Arts and administered by the Arts & Business Council Inc., which works closely with Tourism Development Associates, a tourism consulting agency. The program is designed to fund efforts that link the cultural community to State and regional tourism efforts. The funded initiatives are expected to expand the use of tourism in the creation, presentation and promotion of the State's arts and heritage. The program awards project grants only to arts and cultural organizations partnering with a tourism organization such as a visitors and convention bureau or a county tourism department. The program also requires grantees to collect outcome data.

- *Prelude to the Development of a Statewide Marketing Plan*
This report is the work of a planning commission created to address the cultural tourism planning issues discussed at the Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations' 2000 and 2001 annual conferences. The commission consists of a marketing consultant and leaders from arts and cultural organizations across New York State. The Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations funded this effort. For more information on this initiative, see *Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations - Annual Arts Conference* in this inventory
- *Underground Railroad Promotion Program*
The New York State Division of Tourism is developing a plan to promote the Underground Railroad and related attractions, tours and events across New York State. As part of this effort, the Division has compiled a preliminary inventory of Underground Railroad attractions. The Division will partner with local historical societies and freedom trail commissions in select regions, including Buffalo-Niagara, to develop itineraries, which will be posted on www.IloveNY.com and marketed to motor coach specialists. Outcome data will be collected to develop a market profile. The Division's partners in the Buffalo-Niagara region include the Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau; Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County; Freedom Trail Commission; Motherland Connections and Niagara County Department of Planning, Development & Tourism. The State is funding this initiative.

2.33 Ontario

- *Grand River Management Plan*
In 1995, the Grand River, which flows through Southern Ontario, became the first "urban river" (it passes through approximately 70 urban communities) to be designated as a heritage river. A management plan for the Grand River, *The Grand Strategy for Managing the Grand River as a Canadian Heritage River*, was developed during the nomination process. The plan provides a framework for managing, preserving and strengthening the heritage and recreational resources of the Grand River. Both the development of the management plan and the designation process involved partners from the public and private sectors, including the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation.
- *Ontario's Overnight Visitors with an Outdoors Interest*
This report²⁰ presents market data on Ontario's international and domestic overnight visitors with an outdoor interest, including those visiting a national or provincial park or a historic site. The study looks at where these visitors originated, how long and where they stayed in Ontario, season of travel, visit motivations, size and composition of their travel parties and visit cost, among others. The report was prepared in 2001 by the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation.

- *Ontario's Underground Railroad Cultural Tourism Proposal*
 The Underground Railroad has become a focus of the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation and the Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership's efforts to market Ontario as a tourism destination. The initiative intends to establish the market readiness of the Underground Railroad sites located within Ontario's two existing networks, most of which are in southwestern Ontario. This effort has the financial support of both governmental and non-governmental partners, including a Cultural Strategic Development Fund grant.
- *Packaging Handbook for Tourism Suppliers*
 This handbook²¹ is designed to encourage Ontario's tourism suppliers to develop packages attracting visitors to the area. Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership contracted with the Tourism Company to create this handbook. Divided into three sections, the handbook explains packaging and its benefits, discusses the steps required to build a tourism package (e.g., defining the package components, identifying partners, creating a theme, marketing and tracking results) and provides a series of checklists for testing the market readiness of tourism packages. The checklists address goals and objectives, products, staff, communications, access/transportation, services, marketing, pricing and tickets, partnerships and safety. This report was released in 2000.
- *Packaging the Potential: A Five Year Business Strategy for Cultural and Heritage Tourism in Canada*
 Completed in 1999, this report²² establishes a five-year action plan to increase cultural and heritage tourism in Canada. It focuses on product development, communications and linkages, marketing, education, training and research. The report sets forth three key recommendations, including: (1) increase communications, research and training to study the impacts of, and opportunities in, cultural and heritage tourism, (2) develop and package existing products, and (3) actively market such products primarily in Canadian and U.S. markets. The report represents the work of the Sub-committee on Cultural and Heritage Tourism. The committee was created by the Canadian Tourism Commission and the Department of Canadian Heritage, in order to address the cultural and heritage tourism issues raised in a series of regional roundtables held across Canada in 1997 and 1998.
- *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: A Self-guided Workbook*
 In an effort to assist Ontario tourist destinations in distinguishing themselves as "premier-ranked," the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation contracted with Malone Given Parsons Ltd. to develop an assessment model. *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: A Self-guided Workbook*²³ is designed to assist users assess a tourist destination's market status. The workbook also evaluates performance against measures defined in the Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations Framework, which qualify a premier-ranked destination as one that performs above average in "product, performance and futurity dimensions." For each element, the workbook provides performance measures and criteria. It also describes how to complete a resource audit and performance analysis. The

workbook also guides its users on converting the analyses' conclusions into an action agenda. The Province of Ontario funded the development of this model.

- *Premier Ranked Tourist Destinations: An Evaluation Framework and Its Testing in the South Georgian Bay Region*
This report²⁴ presents an application of the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation's Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations model. In essence, the south Georgian Bay region serves as a pilot for assessing the framework's effectiveness in identifying a premier-ranked tourist destination, as well as the attributes that contribute to or block a destination's ability to attain such a ranking. The report was prepared by Malone Given Parsons Ltd. at the request of the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation. The Province of Ontario provided funding for the report, released in January 2001. For more information on the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation's model, see *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: A Self-guided Workbook* in this inventory.
- *Travel Activities and Motivation Survey – Cultural and Entertainment Segmentation Report*
This report²⁵ is based on a large-scale survey conducted by an association of Canadian Tourism Ministries and organizations. The survey was conducted in both Canada and the United States during 1999 and 2000. The data collected have been used to study the travel patterns and motivators of specific segments of the market, including culture and entertainment. The report examines travelers' demographics, vacation experiences, media consumption habits, sources of information and impressions of Canada and Ontario. Such information could shape initiatives to attract selected visitors to Canada and Ontario. The report was prepared by Lang Research Inc., and was released in 2001.

2.4 Implications of the Inventory

It is hoped that the above compilation of planning initiatives will help illustrate the breadth and depth of planning in the Buffalo-Niagara region's cultural tourism arena. This startling, diverse collection of planning efforts demonstrates, at a minimum, a fundamental recognition by at least some of the stakeholders in the region of the absolute importance of cultural tourism to our artistic and cultural institutions and to the future of Buffalo-Niagara as a region. It will be essential for the Phase 2 comprehensive planning effort to take maximum advantage of this mountain of pre-existing work, to be directly connected to on-going initiatives and, in general, to avoid reinventing the wheel.

That said, it is equally important to recognize that the above inventory demonstrates a severe lack of structure, coordination and efficiency in the region. The recommendations in the next section of this report are designed not only to value existing plans, link them in innovative ways, and tap the wisdom and strengths that they demonstrate, but also to develop a framework for improved cooperation and effectiveness. The stakes are too high to do otherwise.

Section III:

Recommendations for Pursuing a Comprehensive Plan

3.1 Introduction

The recommendations that follow are not developed in the abstract. Indeed, they are founded upon the hard work and valuable perspectives of many people and organizations that have had an active and constructive role in arts, culture and tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region over many years. Clearly, the region does not need to start from scratch in developing a comprehensive plan for cultural tourism. The region does, however, need to act deliberately and aggressively to organize itself in an effective manner, identify a set of priorities, establish a compelling strategy and implement that strategy in a collaborative, efficient way. Simply attempting to glom together the existing planning initiatives will not result in an effective comprehensive plan for the future.

As rich as our resources are, as competent and committed as our stakeholders are, as generous as our public and private funders are and as voluminous as our plans are, the approach to cultural tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region remains largely fractured and inefficient. Recent cooperative efforts have been encouraging but will require acceleration and structure.

Basically, an effective cultural tourism strategy will require: (1) an improved understanding of the region's cultural resources, (2) an appreciation of tourists' current desires and tendencies, (3) an approach to packaging and marketing that successfully integrates factors (1) and (2), and (4) a coordinated approach to effective planning and sustainable funding. The recommendations below attempt to provide for these factors, as well as the structural and procedural steps required to give them vitality. It is important to understand that this set of recommendations is by no means a comprehensive plan – it is a procedural blueprint for pursuing a comprehensive plan.

Any successful approach to cultural tourism in the region will necessarily require cross-sector coordination. Unlike some states and regions, the public sector in Western New York has played a significant role in arts and culture funding and coordination. However, that financial role has been impaired by recent budget dilemmas stemming, in part, from the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks on New York City. For instance, the City of Buffalo, facing severe budget constraints, announced last October its decision to freeze

payments to all not-for-profit organizations, including arts and cultural groups. Other levels of government have also imposed new and difficult limitations on financial support for arts, culture and tourism.

For several reasons, it remains essential that government continue to play an active part in comprehensive planning for arts and culture and cultural tourism in the region. The issues involved are tied too tightly to matters of economic development, land use planning, transportation infrastructure, among others, to expect a successful planning effort without the direct engagement of the public sector in the planning process. Erie County, for example, significantly contributes to cultural tourism through its continued support of the Erie County Office of Arts, Culture and Tourism, directed by Charlene Ritter-Lester, and the Regional Cultural Tourism Program, directed by Patrick Keyes. To the extent that government can and will participate in the funding of cultural tourism, coordination with private and not-for-profit funders is essential and will help determine the potential for cooperative funding strategies. Currently, the impact of funding for arts and culture is reduced not only by public budget constraints, but also by the anecdotal approach to funding pursued by many individual organizations and venues. Basic agreement by funders on application prerequisites of, for example, participation in a regional plan and collaborative approaches to administration and other services could help reconcile overwhelming needs with the limited resources to meet such needs.

Thus the recommendations below seek not only to build on the strengths of existing planning initiatives, but also attempt to provide a significantly improved framework for future growth and development of cultural tourism. While the success of such an approach is inevitably reliant on the support and active cooperation of arts, culture and tourism stakeholders in the region, it is hoped that all parties will appreciate the potential benefits of a collaborative approach overwhelm the issues that have fractured these stakeholders in the past.

3.2 Recommendations

3.21 Organizing a Structure for the Planning Initiative

- a. *Create a coordinating committee:*
Ultimately, a comprehensive planning effort will require coordination and oversight by some entity in the region. That entity arguably could be The John R. Oishei Foundation, which initiated this report; the County of Erie (and/or other counties in the region), which has taken an active role in arts and culture; business, cultural or tourism organizations or others. It is recommended, however, that the coordinating entity should not in fact be any one organization but rather — following the metaphor for the entire planning approach — a collaboration of sectors. Examples of such sectors or stakeholders include: government (e.g. county level), funders (e.g. grantmaker associations), tourism (e.g. convention and visitors' bureaus),

private (e.g. business leaders), arts and cultural organizations/venues (numerous possibilities), and perhaps others. It is recommended that such a coordinating committee be a small group of fewer than ten members with a representative of the private sector as the chairperson. Under this model, the coordinating committee would not carry on the day-to-day work of developing and implementing a comprehensive plan, but would act as an oversight body to which the management of the planning initiative would ultimately report. It is hoped that the Foundation will be willing to take the initiative to organize the proposed coordinating committee.

b. Review and select recommendations:

The first task of the coordinating committee should be to evaluate the recommendations outlined in this report, and perhaps others, and determine which of the proposed steps to pursue. Necessarily, a related determination will need to be made as to whether the required funding is available to support the effort (see Estimated Costs of Comprehensive Planning Initiative, Section 4.1).

c. Appoint a project manager:

It is recommended that the coordinating committee identify and retain a project manager – an organization from within the region familiar with the stakeholders and the issues and history of the Buffalo-Niagara region. This project manager will be responsible for the day-to-day coordination of the development of the comprehensive plan, including direct work with the task groups recommended below, interaction with the coordinating committee and preparation of a planning document. It is further recommended that the project manager take responsibility for the selection and oversight of an external consultant, with national or international expertise in cultural tourism development, to (1) assist in the technical and specialized initiatives recommended below, and (2) to bring a third-party, fresh perspective to the region's cultural tourism planning process. It is recommended that the planning process be unified under the project manager and that the external consultant report to that manager.

d. Convene a spring stakeholder meeting and fall conference:

Toward the goals of communicating the nature and intent of the comprehensive planning initiative, building consensus, engaging stakeholders and establishing active task groups, it is recommended that two primary events be planned for the remainder of 2002:

- Organizational meeting: To be held as soon as practical, this meeting should convene approximately 25-30 leaders in the Buffalo-Niagara region who are already involved in cultural tourism development and whose support will be crucial to the planning process. The primary purpose of the meeting is to outline the proposed comprehensive planning initiative and,

based upon the hoped for consensus to move forward, establish a series of working task groups. These task forces should be organized on a substantive basis along the lines of the major recommendations that follow (e.g. inventory, marketing, funding, economic impact analysis, etc.) and, where appropriate, in direct collaboration with existing initiatives in the region (e.g. Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau's marketing initiative). The organizational structure, including coordinating committee and project manager and the proposed funding for the initiative, should be announced at the meeting. Presumably, the project manager should outline the proposed process for the summer and fall, primarily involving the work of task groups and a conference in the fall.

- Stakeholder conference: This major conference of the broader community of stakeholders in arts, culture and tourism should be planned for the fall of 2002, essentially for the purpose of reporting on the initial work of the task groups and organizing the remainder of the planning initiative and implementation steps. It is not anticipated that a comprehensive plan would be presented at this time. This would be an interim step to ensure the initiative is on course toward a compelling and enduring plan that the cultural tourism community can support.

3.22 *Gathering Essential Information*

a. Inventory and analysis:

The Buffalo-Niagara region has become increasingly aware of the notion and reality that “you can't manage what you can't measure.” This fact is as true in cultural tourism as it is in other dimensions of the region's society and economy. For example, it will be impossible to better correlate the demonstrated desires of cultural tourists with resources in this region if we do not have a comprehensive and specific understanding of those regional resources and assets.

Therefore, it is strongly recommended that a detailed inventory of the region's cultural and arts resources be completed as a part of the comprehensive planning effort. Such an inventory is very different from the inventory included in this Phase 1 report. Rather than a listing of planning initiatives (Phase 1), this inventory (Phase 2) is to be a roster of venues, events, attractions, services and so on. **Appendix D** is attached, not as a completed matrix for an inventory, but as a fairly comprehensive listing of the kind of information that might be collected on arts and cultural resources. As a part of the Phase 2 initiative, this listing should be pared down and honed by the appropriate task group to include only the agreed-upon information. The Phase 2 inventory should include very

specific information not only on arts and cultural venues, events, etc., but also on the region's related resources such as hospitality accommodations, information services and transportation infrastructure.

One of the many advantages of this rather painstaking effort is to more easily identify opportunities for certain clusters, packaging and partnerships that have the potential to strengthen cultural and arts assets. It also would prove useful in further developing information services such as a regional cultural tourism web site, directories and collaborative promotional material or funding applications.

It is important to understand that there are many opportunities for cooperation in the preparation of an inventory. As demonstrated in the planning inventory in this Phase 1 report, there are several cultural tourism asset inventories currently under way within the region, including a new initiative organized by Southern Ontario.

b. Market analysis

In order to identify and characterize the region's current and potential cultural tourists, it is recommended that a market analysis that constructs a tourist profile be conducted. Such a profile should aim to address the typical Buffalo-Niagara region tourist's point of origin, length of stay, sought-after attractions and services, means of travel to and throughout the region, as well as the reason for travel.

A market analysis is a nearly universal element of regional cultural tourism plans and can help gauge the potential of the Buffalo-Niagara region's cultural tourism sector. The data collected through a market analysis will create a profile of those tourists that are most appropriate to the region's resources and therefore should be a primary target of critically important packaging efforts, promotional material and further resource development. The market data are also useful in identifying barriers (for instance, a lack of public transportation) and opportunities (new information on tourists' point of origin, for example) for cultural tourism development.

3.23 *Establishing Regional Priorities and the Means by which they are Implemented*

a. Definitions:

It will be essential at the outset of the planning initiative to come to terms with several notions that are fundamental to the effort. What may seem obvious by way of definition of these notions is not really clear at all in some cases, and therefore serves as an impediment to effective action and collaboration. What kinds of activities and venues are included within the definition of "arts and culture?" Does "tourist" mean a visitor from outside the Buffalo-Niagara region or simply anyone who visits a local

venue?²⁶ As outlined earlier, what is the “region” for purposes of this planning initiative?

Ensuring that stakeholders are on the same page in their use of terms can go a long way toward overcoming some of the current tensions and inefficiencies that impair the cultural tourism effort in the region, and can assist in the crucial factors of competently packaging definable products for definable audiences. Agreed-upon definitions can help shape the plan itself and assist in its implementation.

b. Goals and timeframes:

In order to achieve measurable, specific outcomes, a cultural tourism plan should have clearly identified short-term and long-term goals as well as timeframes for achieving those goals. Inherent in these goals should be any economic (e.g. increased economic development opportunities), cultural (e.g. further development of arts resources), social (e.g. better educational opportunities), financial (e.g. securing grants, coordinating funding) or environmental (e.g. historic preservation) objectives that the plan intends to meet. Clearly, the relevant task groups should play a major role in establishing the appropriate goals within a certain area of the initiative. An estimated time framework, based upon a 14-month Phase 2 planning initiative, is proposed below:

Estimated Time Framework for Development of a Comprehensive Plan	
2002	
May	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appointment of coordinating committee and selection of chairperson • Identification and appointment of project manager • Review of Phase 1 recommendations and consensus to proceed
June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organizational meeting of 25-30 stakeholders • Naming of task groups and development of initial work programs • Identification and appointment of external consultant
July-October	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work of task groups, in coordination with project manager and consultant • Preliminary development of inventory, market analysis, economic impact analysis
November	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Major stakeholder conference
December	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Analysis of results of preliminary work and conference
2003	
January-April	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued development of inventory, market analysis, economic impact analysis
February-June	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development and drafting of a comprehensive plan
July	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Stakeholder conference focused on implementation

c. Asset/resource development:

While planning for cultural tourism nearly always involves inventorying existing resources and marketing those resources, there is an intervening step that has sometimes been missed in Buffalo-Niagara and other regions across the country; that is, attention to asset/resource development or the creation of an improved product to then be marketed.

Indeed, the goal for cultural tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region is not fundamentally different from the resource development imperative in the broader scope of economic development in the region. The prerequisite need to improve the product (the region as a place to do business) to be marketed to site selectors and businesses is the primary goal of, for example, the “Buffalo-Niagara Now” effort coordinated by the Buffalo Niagara Partnership.

Clearly the data collected during the inventory and market analysis, two of the steps recommended above, will help identify opportunities and inadequacies in the region’s toolbox of cultural tourism assets. This effort can then become an important part of the goal of marshalling financial resources for tasks that are of direct impact and have measurable outcomes. The resource development dimension of the comprehensive plan should be detailed to the degree that it assigns tasks to individuals or organizations, itemizes potential funding sources and sets timeframes and a basis for review. As much as and more than any part of the comprehensive planning initiative, resource development should incorporate and/or coordinate with efforts already under way in the region to enhance cultural tourism assets.

Examples of potential strategies for resource development are as follows:

- Develop quality packages that include a mix of cultural and non-cultural activities, lodging, meals and travel that target specific market segments and are responsive to the demonstrated preferences of today’s tourists
- Produce an electronic information clearinghouse/web site with e-commerce capabilities to supply potential cultural tourists with information on upcoming and ongoing cultural events, activities, attractions, tickets, packages, accommodations and travel
- Refine the requirements of cultural funding programs to provide an incentive to organizations to achieve the plan’s resource development goals (e.g., grants for innovative and collaborative packaging, infrastructure improvements, etc.)
- Develop packages focused on extending lengths of stay and increasing mid-week and/or off-season business

d. Marketing and promotion:

Another essential step in the cultural tourism planning process is developing coordinated marketing campaign(s) and ensuring that the “message” reaches not only a wide enough audience but also an appropriate audience. The market analysis, which will identify and characterize the region’s current and potential tourists, should serve as the foundation for this process. The marketing slogans, advertisements, packages and strategies should parallel the trends and data revealed by the

market analysis. This portion of the planning process should identify the region's marketing objectives as well as describe in detail the strategies and steps taken to reach these objectives.

Examples of potential strategies for marketing and promotion include:

- Consolidate and coordinate the marketing efforts already under way throughout the Buffalo-Niagara region to eliminate duplication and promote a clear and consistent image of the region as a cultural destination
- Identify and target niche markets
- Create a brand name/slogan for cultural tourism in the Buffalo-Niagara region

e. *Education and training*

It is further recommended that both the planning process and the longer-term implementation include an active education and training component. This effort would focus not only on training regarding the nature, goals and specific elements of the comprehensive plan itself, but also on topics such as “best practices” in promoting the arts, grant writing, collaborative models, administration and other topics of value to a continuing cultural tourism initiative. Such an effort would assist not only in disseminating information, but also in providing a context for networking among stakeholders. Various regional resources in business and education (e.g. Niagara University's College of Hospitality and Tourism Management, University at Buffalo's School of Management, etc.) could be enlisted to assist with this education and training component.

3.24 *Funding Sustainability*

a. *Encourage more efficient use of existing funds*

With so many cultural entities and advocates competing for a limited pot of financing, the goal of coordinating cultural tourism efforts and maximizing scarce resources becomes central to the long-term success of a regional comprehensive plan. Funding entities — including private, public and not-for-profit sources — should cooperate in establishing pools of funding and common guidelines focused on promoting collaboration and administrative efficiencies among grant/loan applicants. Preference should be given to applicants that partner or consolidate with other organizations or pursue steps to streamline administrative or other services.

b. *Identify additional sources of funding*

Although, as outlined above, increased efficiency and coordination of grant funding is critically important, it is also true that the total amount of funding will need to be increased, especially in light of cutbacks stemming from budget dilemmas created by the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks

on New York City. Every opportunity should be pursued to develop innovative, collaborative approaches that improve the potential for support from new public, private and not-for-profit sources. Again, a less anecdotal approach to funding requests is likely to result in improved competitiveness for new dollars for arts and culture and cultural tourism. As with other major recommendations in this report, it is suggested that a specific task group be formed to review funding approaches in the region.

3.25 *Evaluation and Assessment*

a. Data collection and research

As expressed earlier in this report, the region has become increasingly focused on the notion that “you can’t manage what you can’t measure.” Any plan, including a cultural tourism plan, has a better chance of achieving its goals if the specific means by which to measure success are established. The focus of this section of the planning process is to develop the tools and parameters to identify and track economic, consumer and tourism data, which will ultimately serve as a basis for gauging success.

Potential strategies for data collection and research include:

- Develop a set of performance indicators that reflects the progress of the cultural tourism plan as well as its marketing and product-development strategies. These indicators might include economic impact, attendance at events and venues, length of stay and return on investment for key markets, events or packages
- Establish the tools and mechanisms required for cultural and tourism organizations to track indicator data
- Create self-assessment tools that will enable cultural tourism organizations to evaluate the effectiveness of their internal strategies and operations, improve efficiencies and therefore become more responsible to funding sources and investors

b. Economic impact analysis:

Arts and culture and the cultural tourism industry clearly play a vital role in supporting the Buffalo-Niagara region’s economy. An improved understanding of the employment, spending and tax revenues generated, both directly and indirectly, by culture and arts in the region is crucial to appreciating the industry’s impact upon the Buffalo-Niagara region. Therefore, to demonstrate quantitatively the profound impact that arts and culture and cultural tourism have on the region, it is essential to include a comprehensive economic impact analysis as part of the planning process.

Available technology such as IMPLAN software can assess the economic impact of arts and culture and cultural tourism businesses and venues. For instance, the IMPLAN model isolates SIC codes related to the cultural

tourism industry and applies multipliers to determine the direct, indirect or induced effects of such sectors on spending, employment, labor income and business taxes, among other indicators, based on data specific to the Buffalo-Niagara region. The results of such analyses demonstrate in clear, objective terms the significance of arts and culture and the cultural tourism industry to the economic vigor of the Buffalo-Niagara region.

Such analyses will assist not only in the comprehensive planning process but also in advocacy efforts with potential funders, perhaps governmental funders in particular. In the current budget climate for public and many private funders, clear evidence pointing to the economic value of arts and culture and cultural tourism will be required if there is to be substantial hope for sustained funding. As an example, a quantitative analysis detailing the impact, in dollars, of boosting annual attendance at a museum or lengthening visitors' stays by one day, will not only make the planning process more focused and compelling but also assist funders in identifying investment priorities.

3.26 Long-term Coordination

The first recommendation in this report proposes a Coordinating Committee to oversee the preparation of the comprehensive plan. This leaves open, however, the important question of longer-term coordination of the plan's implementation and perpetual updating. There is no attempt at this point to anticipate the nature or make-up of a permanent entity in that such a group properly should spring from the planning process over the next year.

Presumably, but not necessarily, the Coordinating Committee proposed to guide the planning process will conclude its work with the promulgation of the comprehensive plan and a new model of stakeholder group will need to be established to help coordinate long-term strategy and implementation. At a minimum, it would be useful to have a degree of overlap between the two entities to make the transition from planning to implementation as seamless as possible. In any case, a permanent model should also represent a cross-section of stakeholders within arts and culture and cultural tourism as well as related interests from business, education and other groups that can bring a helpful perspective to the important work of a coordinating body. A final determination as to the nature and structure of this entity should be made as a part of the comprehensive planning document in 2003.

Section IV: Conclusion

4.1 Estimated Costs of Comprehensive Planning Initiative

To estimate the full costs of the comprehensive planning initiative, it will be necessary to determine which of the above recommendations will be adopted and implemented, particularly those pertaining to major undertakings such as a market study, economic impact analysis and resource inventory. It is recommended that the Project Manager be charged with the handling of, and accounting for funds for the project, including financial arrangements with staff, consultant(s), printers and all others. While much of the required work, especially pertaining to the proposed task groups, will be accomplished by volunteers from the arts, culture and tourism communities, it is suggested that the goals of the comprehensive plan will not be achieved without the direct engagement of retained professionals for overall management and specialized consulting tasks.

On the assumption that the basic structure and process recommended in this report are adopted, it is anticipated that the total 14-month cost of the planning initiative would be approximately \$275,000 to \$300,000.

4.2 Buffalo-Niagara at a Fork in the Road

The inimitable Yogi Berra is reported to have counseled a group of school children, “when you come to a fork in the road, TAKE IT!” The Buffalo-Niagara region is indeed at a fork in the road as we contemplate our future in cultural tourism and many other dimensions of our community. For better or worse, however, the region does not have the luxury of taking Yogi’s advice. We clearly cannot take every road or option available and must make some deliberate, often hard choices and commit ourselves to them if we are to achieve a positive, enduring quality of life and vibrant economy.

Many people and groups will need to make such choices if a compelling comprehensive plan for cultural tourism is to be a reality in the region. Inevitably, there are different choices for different stakeholders – some involve funding, others involve active participation and hard work, many involve willingness to set aside some longstanding turf matters in relation to other stakeholders. Common to all stakeholders in the region,

however, is the stark reality that the issues that divide them are overwhelmed by the issues and goals that can and should unite them.

As the region stands at Yogi's metaphorical "fork," the proposed comprehensive planning initiative can serve as the productive and lucrative choice ahead, paved with enduring collaboration, efficiency and definable outcomes. The alternative route is one laden with well-worn ruts of redundancy, inefficiency and uncertain destination. Several recent actions give great encouragement that the first option is a viable, practical possibility for the region. The willingness of The John R. Oishei Foundation to initiate and fund the effort to date, the generous help of many stakeholders in providing information and perspective for this report and the preliminary support of some major stakeholders for a comprehensive plan all are very hopeful signs. The important thing now is to build upon this momentum and move forward to Phase 2 of the planning initiative.

Appendices

Appendix A:
Sample Letter and Survey Mailed to Umbrella Organizations

January 28, 2002

Title
Organization
Street Address
City, State, Zip Code

Dear Title:

In recent months, an ad hoc Cultural Tourism Steering Committee, convened by The John R. Oishei Foundation, has begun to explore ways to improve resource development and coordination for Western New York's arts and cultural organizations. In support of this initiative, the Steering Committee has contracted with the University at Buffalo Institute for Local Governance and Regional Growth to undertake the first phase of a two-phase planning process. We at the Institute hope you will participate in this effort.

The Steering Committee's two-phase process includes (1) the development of an inventory of previous and current efforts toward arts/culture planning, along with a blueprint for further planning; and (2) the creation of a regional plan for coordinating arts and cultural resource development in Buffalo-Niagara. Our Institute, as part of the Phase I effort, has agreed to conduct the requested **inventory of previous and current planning efforts**, both for arts and cultural issues generally and for cultural tourism initiatives. I want to emphasize that this inventory of planning initiatives is designed to help the Steering Committee understand and value existing efforts, as well as to, ultimately, attempt to coordinate with them in the Phase II planning process.

We will call you in the next few weeks to ask for your help with this inventory. We are reaching out to arts councils, convention and visitors bureaus, chambers of commerce, and other organizations likely to have overseen or participated in the development of broadly based strategies. **We encourage you to look over the attached sheet in anticipation of a telephone conversation.** We also hope you will be willing to compile and send us any related materials (planning outlines, brochures, etc. that will help to explain initiatives you have worked on.

Please note that this Phase I inventory will *not* be an inventory of venues, events, or groups, although such information may be needed in later stages of planning. Rather, we are looking for information about coordinated planning initiatives. Such initiatives might focus on a theme, interest area, or district. They might represent a strategic arts and cultural plan for several organizations within one municipality, or involve coordination of administrative functions. Our goal is to cast the net broadly, so as to help the Steering Committee learn about the ways in which you and your colleagues are already coordinating your efforts. Your participation is essential if this effort is to serve a practical, value purpose.

Sharon Entress of our Institute team will be calling you in the next few weeks to seek your input. Again, we are eager for your participation, and look forward to talking with you. Should you have any questions in the meantime, please feel free to call Sharon or me at 716/829-3777. Warmest wishes for the New Year.

Very truly yours,

John B. Sheffer, II
Director
Enclosure

**QUESTIONS FOR INVENTORY OF PRIOR/CURRENT EFFORTS AT
COORDINATED PLANNING FOR ARTS/CULTURE INITIATIVES
AND CULTURAL TOURISM PROGRAMS**

1. What, if any, strategies, plans, or initiatives for coordinating arts and cultural programs and organizations are you **currently** involved in?
2. Who, if any, are your partners in that effort? What arts/cultural or coordinating organizations are included in it? Was funding provided for the initiative?
3. When is it expected to be completed, or is it an ongoing effort? We would like to include your initiative in the inventory. Is a copy available for us to summarize?
4. What, if any, strategies, plans, or initiatives for coordinating arts and cultural programs and organizations have you **previously** been involved in?
5. Who, if any, were your partners in that effort? What arts/cultural or coordinating organizations were included in it? Was funding provided for the initiative?
6. When was it completed, or is it an ongoing effort? We would like to include your initiative in the inventory. Is a copy available for us to summarize?
7. Have specific outcomes of that effort (attendance, grants, revenues, estimated impact) been documented?
8. For both current and previous efforts, have you or others gathered specific market data, and if so, are you willing to share them for purposes of this inventory?
9. Are there similar initiatives/plans from outside Western New York/Southern Ontario that you would recommend as good precedents for our region?

Appendix B: **Mailing List**

Mr. David McLaughlin
Akron Chamber of Commerce
47 Main Street
Akron, NY 14001

Mr. Edward O'Connor
Alden Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 149
Alden, NY 14004-0149

Mr. Jesse Case
Allegany County Tourism Office
County Office Building, Room 208, 7
Court Street
Belmont, NY 14813-1039

Ms. Judith Kaufman Weiner
*Alliance of New York State Arts
Organizations*
PO Box 96, 246 Love Lane
Mattituck, NY 11952

Ms. Colleen DiPirro
Amherst Chamber of Commerce
325 Essjay Road, Suite 200
Williamsville, NY 14221

Ms. Deborah Kirkwood
Arcade Area Chamber of Commerce
278 Main Street
Arcade, NY 14009

Ms. Lisa Potter
Arts & Business Council Inc.
121 West 27th Street, Suite 702
New York, NY 10001

Dr. Walter Pond
Arts Council for Wyoming County
31 South Main Street, PO Box 249
Perry, NY 14530

Ms. Celeste Lawson
Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County
700 Main Street, 1st floor
Buffalo, NY 14202

Mr. Philip Morris
Arts Council of Chautauqua County
116 East Third Street
Jamestown, NY 14701

Mr. Lumon Ross
Black Chamber of Commerce
c/o Mr. Lumon Ross, 517 Woodlawn
Avenue
Buffalo, NY 14208

Mr. David Granville
Buffalo Arts Commission
920 City Hall
Buffalo, NY 14202

Mr. David Lacki
*Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors
Bureau Inc.*
617 Main St., Suite 400
Buffalo, NY 14203-1496

Ms. Leslie Hornung
Buffalo Niagara Enterprise
665 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14203-1487

Dr. Andrew Rudnick
Buffalo Niagara Partnership
665 Main Street, Suite 200
Buffalo, NY 14203-1487

Ms. Deborah Ann Trimble
Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy
84 Parkside Avenue, Parkside Lodge
Buffalo, NY 14214

Mr. Ted Pietrzak
*Buffalo State College, Burchfield-Penney Art
Center*
1300 Elmwood Avenue
Buffalo, NY 14222

Mr. Jim Watson
Canadian Tourism Commission
235 Queen Street, 8th Floor, West
Tower
Ottawa, Ontario, CANADA K1A 0H6

Ms. Susan Vahl
Cattaraugus County Arts Council
PO Box 406
Olean, NY 14760

Mr. Thomas Livak
*Cattaraugus County Economic Development,
Planning & Tourism*
County Center, 303 Court Street
Little Valley, NY 14755

Mr. Kurt Alverson CAE
Chamber of Commerce of the Tonawandas
15 Webster Street
North Tonawanda, NY 14120

Ms. Margaret Kenney
Chamber of Commerce Olean & Vicinity
251 North Union Street
Olean, NY 14760

Ms. Pamela Lydic
Chautauqua County Chamber of Commerce
212 Lake Shore Drive West
Dunkirk, NY 14048

Ms. Debra Greenberg
Cheektowaga Chamber of Commerce
Appletree Business Park, 2875 Union
Road, Suite 50
Cheektowaga, NY 14227

Mr. Neil Everson
City of Hamilton Economic Development
One James Street South, 9th Floor
Hamilton, CANADA L8P 4R5

Mr. John Leamer
Clarence Chamber of Commerce
8975 Main Street
Clarence, NY 14031

Mr. Doug Fenton
Dunkirk Chamber of Commerce
212 Lake Shore Drive West
Dunkirk, NY 14048

Mr. David Kinyon
Eastern Niagara Chamber of Commerce
Canal Terrace, 151 West Genesee Street
Lockport, NY 14094

Ms Jaclyn Smith
Eden Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 2
Eden, NY 14057

Mr. Brian McFadden
Ellicottville Area Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 456
Ellicottville, NY 14731

Mr. Lewis Rich Jr.
Empire State Development-WNY Region
420 Main Street, 717 Liberty Bldg
Buffalo, NY 14202

Mr. Robert Skerker
*Erie County Cultural Resources Advisory
Board*
c/o 95 Franklin Street, Room 1064
Buffalo, NY 14202

Mr. Laurence Rubin
*Erie County Environment & Planning
Department*
Rath Building, 95 Franklin Street
Buffalo, NY 14202

Ms. Caryl Ashley Youngers
Evans/Brant Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 256
Derby, NY 14047-0256

Ms. Wendy Westwood
Fredonia Chamber of Commerce
5 E. Main Street
Fredonia, NY 14063

Mr. Raymond SanFratello
Genesee County Chamber of Commerce
210 East Main Street
Batavia, NY 14020

Ms. Linda Blanchet
Genesee-Orleans Regional Arts Council
204 East Main Street
Batavia, NY 14020-2206

Mr. Bryan Bradley
Gowanda Area Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 45, 28 Jamestown Street
Gowanda, NY 14070

Mr. Ted Bates
Grand Island Chamber of Commerce
1980 Whitehaven Road
Grand Island, NY 14072

Mr. Gary Grote
Greater East Aurora Chamber of Commerce
431 Main Street
East Aurora, NY 14052

Mr. John Sayegh
Greater Olean Area Chamber of Commerce
120 N. Union Street
Olean, NY 14780

Ms. Betty Newell
Hamburg Chamber of Commerce
8 South Buffalo Street
Hamburg, NY 14075

Ms. Ann Enger
Kenmore-Town of Tonawanda Chamber of Commerce
3411 Delaware Avenue
Kenmore, NY 14217

Ms. Suzanna Gannon
Lackawanna Area Chamber of Commerce
638 Ridge Road Rear
Lackawanna, NY 14218

Ms. Kathy Konst
Lancaster Area Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 284, 39 Central Avenue
Lancaster, NY 14086-0284

Ms. Diedre Litt
Lewiston Council on the Arts
PO Box 1
Lewiston, NY 14092-0001

Mr. William McKeever
National Audubon Society-Main St.
712 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14202

Honorable Joseph Morelle
New York State Assembly, District #132
LOB, Room 716
Albany, NY 12248

Honorable Paul Tokasz
New York State Assembly, District #143-Local
General Donovan Bldg., 125 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14203

Ms. Mary Ellen Walsh
New York State Division of Tourism
Empire State Plaza, Main Concourse,
Room 110
Albany, NY 12220

Mr. Edward Rutkowski
New York State Parks, Recreation & Historic Preservation-Niagara Falls
Prospect Park, PO Box 1132
Niagara Falls, NY 14303-1132

Ms. Christine Heeg
Niagara Council of the Arts
300 Fourth Street
Niagara Falls, NY 14303

Mr. Samuel Ferraro
*Niagara County Department of Planning,
Development & Tourism*
Brooks Co. Office Bldg., 59 Park
Avenue
Lockport, NY 14094-2740

Mr. William Connor
*Niagara Economic and Tourism Corporation -
Canada (NETCorp)*
2201 St. David's Road, PO Box 1042,
Stn. Main
Thorold, Ontario, CANADA L2V 4T7

Mr. Stan Rydelek
Niagara Falls Convention & Visitors Bureau
310 Fourth Street
Niagara Falls, NY 14303

Mr. Fred Caso
Niagara USA Chamber
345 Third Street, Suite 500
Niagara Falls, NY 14303

Ms. Janice Thomson
*Niagara-on-the-Lake Chamber of Commerce
and Visitor and Convention Bureau*
26 Queen Street (lower level), PO Box
1043
Niagara-on-the-Lake, CANADA L0S
1J0

Ms. Arlene White
*Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and
Recreation-St. Catherines Field Office*
301 St. Paul St., 9th Floor
St. Catherines, CANADA L2R 7R4

Mr. Michael Langford
*Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and
Recreation-Toronto*
900 Bay Street, 9th Floor, Hearst Block
Toronto, Ontario, CANADA M7A 2E1

Ms. Jean Lam
Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership
900 Bay Street, 10th Floor, Hearst Block
Toronto, Ontario, CANADA M7A 2E1

Mr. Noel Buckley
Ontario Visitors and Convention Bureau
5515 Stanley Avenue
Niagara Falls, CANADA I2G3X4

Ms. Nancy Conley
Orchard Park Chamber of Commerce
4211 North Buffalo Rd, Suite 14
Orchard Park, NY 14127-2401

Ms. Beth Krolak
Orleans County Chamber of Commerce
433 Main Street
Medina, NY 14103

Mr. Wayne Hale Jr.
Orleans County Department of Tourism
14016 Route 31 West
Albion, NY 14411

Mr. Timothy Tielman
Preservation Coalition of Erie County
567 Lafayette Avenue
Buffalo, NY 14222

Mr. Sue Washington
Salamanca Chamber of Commerce
26 Main Street
Salamanca, NY 14779

Ms. Teresa Mitchell
Seaway Trail
Corner of W. Main and Ray Sts.
Sackets Harbor, NY 13685

Mr. Duane Fischer
Springville Chamber of Commerce
PO Box 310
Springville, NY 14141

Mr. Doug Fyfe
Tourism Toronto
207 Queens Quay West, PO Box 126
Toronto, Ontario, CANADA M5J 1A7

Professor Robert Shibley
UB Urban Design Project
272 Hayes Hall
3435 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14214

Ms. Elizabeth Benson
Waterfront Regeneration Trust
207 Queen's Quay West, Suite 403
Toronto, Ontario, CANADA M5J 1A7

Mr. Scott Northrop
Wellsville Chamber of Commerce
The Davie Building, 114 North Main
Street
Wellsville, NY 14895

Mr. Carol Dill
West Seneca Chamber of Commerce
950 A Union Road, Suite 5
West Seneca, NY 14224

Ms. Andrea Capwell
*Western New York Association of Historical
Agencies*
PO Box 253
LeRoy, NY 14482

Mr. James Pierce
Wyoming County Chamber of Commerce
6470 Route 20A, Suite 2
Perry, NY 14530-9787

Ms. Diane Johnson-Jaeckel
Wyoming County Tourist Promotion Agency
30 N. Main Street
Castile, NY 14427

Appendix C: **Survey Respondents and Interviewees**

Akron Chamber of Commerce
Alden Chamber of Commerce
Allegany County Tourism Office
Alliance of New York State Arts Organizations
Americans for the Arts
Arcade Area Chamber of Commerce
Arts & Business Council Inc.
Arts Council for Wyoming County
Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County
Arts Council of Chautauqua County
Black Chamber of Commerce
Buffalo Arts Commission
Buffalo Audubon Society
Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau Inc.
Buffalo Niagara Enterprise
Buffalo Niagara Partnership
Buffalo Olmsted Parks Conservancy
Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau Cultural Tourism Committee
Burchfield-Penney Art Center
Canadian Tourism Commission
Cattaraugus County Arts Council
Cattaraugus County Department of Economic Development, Planning & Tourism
Chamber of Commerce of the Tonawandas
Chamber of Commerce Olean & Vicinity
Chautauqua County Chamber of Commerce
Chautauqua County Visitors' Bureau
Cheektowaga Chamber of Commerce
City of Toronto Department of Tourism
Cultural Alliance of Niagara
Dunkirk Chamber of Commerce
Eastern Niagara Chamber of Commerce
Eden Chamber of Commerce
Ellicottville Area Chamber of Commerce
Empire State Development-WNY Region
Erie Canalway National Heritage Corridor Planning Commission

Erie County Cultural Resources Advisory Board
Erie County Department of Environment and Planning
Evans/Brant Chamber of Commerce
Fredonia Chamber of Commerce
Genesee County Chamber of Commerce
Genesee-Orleans Regional Arts Council
Gowanda Area Chamber of Commerce
Grand Island Chamber of Commerce
Greater East Aurora Chamber of Commerce
Hamburg Chamber of Commerce
Kenmore-Town of Tonawanda Chamber of Commerce
Lackawanna Area Chamber of Commerce
Lancaster Area Chamber of Commerce
Lewiston Council on the Arts
Honorable Joseph D. Morelle, New York State Assembly, District #132
Honorable Paul A. Tokasz, New York State Assembly, District #143
New York State Division of Tourism
New York State Parks, Recreation & Historic Preservation
New York State Planning Commission for the Erie Canal Corridor
Niagara Council of the Arts
Niagara County Department of Planning, Development & Tourism
Niagara Economic and Tourism Corporation
Niagara Falls Chamber of Commerce
Niagara Falls Tourism
Niagara USA Chamber
Niagara-on-the-Lake Chamber of Commerce and Visitor and Convention Bureau
Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation
Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership
Ontario Visitors and Convention Bureau
Orchard Park Chamber of Commerce
Orleans County Chamber of Commerce
Orleans County Tourism Agency
Preservation Coalition of Erie County
Regional Cultural Tourism Program
Seaway Trail

University at Buffalo Urban Design Project
Wellsville Chamber of Commerce
West Seneca Chamber of Commerce
Western New York Association of Historical Agencies
Wyoming County Chamber of Commerce
Wyoming County Tourist Promotion Agency

Appendix D: **Inventory Matrix**

PROPOSED INVENTORY ITEMS

A. Organizational Profile

- Organization name, address, county, telephone/fax, website
- Contact name, title, and phone number
- President/Executive Director
- Type/status of organization (commercial, individual artist, governmental, not-for-profit, volunteer)
- Functions of organization (artist/producer, sponsor/presenter, resource/service provider, reproducer, distributor, broadcaster, education)
- Year founded
- Description of organization (200 words or less)
- Mission/purpose of organization (200 words or less)
- Target audience (general, at-risk youth, disabled, ethnic, hospitals, low-income/economically disadvantaged, nursing homes, prisons/correctional facilities, religious, rural communities, seniors, schools, teens, youth, other)
- Description of facilities (administration space, exhibit space, performance space, rehearsal space, studios, parking)
- Number of members, membership dues, membership profile (as applicable to associations)

B. Resources

- Annual Expenses

Personnel/Payroll

Administrative

Artist

Support

Technical

Operating

Contracted services

Fundraising

Insurance

Marketing/Advertising

Museum shop/souvenir stand products

Office equipment and supplies

Travel/transportation

Facilities

Building/grounds maintenance and security

Rent/mortgage

Utilities

Other

Grants made, number and amount

- Annual Income

Operations (admission/ticket sales, concessions, membership fees, subscriptions, contracted services, tuition/workshop fees, rental income, fundraising events)

Private contributions (corporations/business, foundations, private individuals)

Public support (federal, state, county, city/town/village)

Investment earnings

Endowment

Assets/Debt

- Value of capital (real estate, buildings, equipment, material)
- Value of all financial assets
- Value of endowment
- Total debt

Staff/Personnel

- Total number of full-time, part-time, contract, and volunteer employees
- Number of employees in the following categories: (i) artistic, (ii) administrative, (iii) education, (iv) technical/production, (v) support
- Total annual payroll
- Total hours of service provided by volunteers and unpaid interns

C. Services

- Annual number of shows, presentations, productions, films, exhibits, courses/workshops, tours
- Annual visits/attendance to each of the above (total, paid, unpaid, reduced price, in-state, out-of-state)
- Educational programs (number of, type, attendance)

D. Access Data

- Seasons/days/hours of operation
- Availability of public transportation to the site
- Ticket/admissions fees
- Availability of free/reduced-priced promotions or discount cards
- Availability of ticket packages and patronage packages
- Seating capacity, where applicable
- Profile/demographics of attendees (*e.g.* age, gender, race, income, residence)
- Programs targeted to underserved populations such as children from low-income households, people of diverse ethnic backgrounds, the elderly, or persons with disabilities
- Availability of sign language interpreters
- Wheelchair accessibility
- Marketing efforts (mail, radio, newspapers, magazines, posters, public transit vehicles, internet, businesses/employers)

- Participation in local fairs and festivals
- Availability of portable arts/cultural/educational programs
- Participation in tourism packages and programs

E. Education/Learning

- Dollar amount spent on community educational programs
- Participation in arts/cultural trade shows (e.g. for artists and art educators)
- Availability of professional development residencies, fellowships, or workshops for artists
- Availability of training programs, internships, mentorships or youth-generated performances for students

F. Partnerships

- Sharing of administrative resources
- Sharing of artistic resources
- Participation on task forces addressing issues of mutual concern within the arts/cultural community
- Collaboration with social service or health and human services agencies to create positive arts experiences for at-risk youth
- Involvement in a neighborhood or historic area
- Participation in artistic competitions, festivals, trade shows or conferences
- Participation in domestic or international exchange programs
- Participation in regular meetings with leaders of other arts/cultural organizations
- Number of board members recruited from outside the arts/cultural community
- Leadership serving as trustees, volunteers, advisors to the public and private sector

PROPOSED INVENTORY CLASSIFICATIONS

A. Age of Institution/Organization

- 1-20 years
- 21-40 years
- 41-60 years
- 61-80 years
- 81-100 years
- 101-150 years
- 151+ years

B. Discipline

Design Arts

- Architecture
- City Planning
- Fashion
- Graphic
- Industrial
- Interior
- Landscape Architecture

History

- Historic sites
- Historical societies
- Preservation groups
- Tours

Literary Arts

- Fiction
- Non-fiction
- Playwriting
- Poetry

Media Arts

- Computer/digital art
- Film
- Installation art
- Intermedia arts
- Radio
- Television
- Video

Performing Arts

- Dance
- Music
- Opera
- Theatre

Photography/Holography

Visual Arts

- Crafts
- Graphics/printmaking

Multimedia
Painting
Sculpture

Interdisciplinary/Multidisciplinary

C. Function

Artist/Producer (*art creators and/or performers*)

Presenter/Sponsor of:

Artists
Contests
Educational programs
Events (*e.g.* exhibitions, performances, readings, festivals, fairs)

Reproducer, Distributor, Broadcaster (*e.g.* bookstore, library, media)

Arts and Cultural Resource/Service Provider

Exhibition space
Performance space
Studio space

Bibliographical/archival resources
Conservation services
Technical services and equipment
Resources for publications

Financial services
Funding
Legal services
Management and planning services
Sales and marketing services

Arts and Cultural Education

D. Geography

Urban/Suburban/Rural
County (Allegany, Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Erie, Genesee, Niagara, Orleans, Wyoming)

E. Operations

Annual number of shows, presentations, productions, films, exhibits, courses/workshops, tours
Number of operating seasons (spring, summer, fall, winter)

F. Sector/Support

Sector
Association (membership-based)
Commercial
Government
Individual artist/performer
Not-for-profit

Volunteer
Support
Percentage of budget from:
Private contributions (corporations/business, foundations, private individuals)
Public support (federal, state, county, city/town/village)
Earned income
Investment earnings
Endowment

G. Size

As measured by:
Annual attendance
Number of staff members
Dollar amount of operating budget

H. Target Audience

General
At-risk youth
Disabled
Ethnic communities
Hospital populations
Low-income/economically disadvantaged populations
Nursing home populations
Prison/correctional facility populations
Religious communities
Rural communities
Seniors
Schools
Teens
Youth
Other special-focus group

I. Type of Institution

Arts center
Art museum
Arts/cultural consultant
Arts/cultural council
Arts/cultural society/association
Arts/cultural foundation
Bookstore
Coffee shop/restaurant/bar
Dance company
Educational institution
Gallery
Historical site/landmark (National Register of Historic Places)
Historical society/association
Individual artists/performers
Library
Literary organization
Museum
Music company

Music hall
Orchestra
Planetarium
Point of interest in Western New York
Preservation society
Publisher
Theatre company
Theatre/cinema

Appendix E: **Bibliography**

Arts Council of Park City and Summit County. Arts and Culture Master Plan: Needs Assessment Study. Utah: Arts Council of Park City and Summit County, 1999.

ArtsMarket. *Indianapolis Cultural Tourism Research Report and Recommendations*. Indiana: Arts Council of Indianapolis, nd.

City of Indianapolis. *The Indianapolis Cultural Development Initiative: Building Participation Through Cultural Tourism*. Indiana: City of Indianapolis, 2001.

Cleveland Foundation Civic Study Commission on the Performing Arts. *Securing the Future*. Ohio: Cleveland Foundation Civic Study Commission on the Performing Arts, 1996. Available at http://www.cultureplan.org/research_civic_study2.html.

Community Partnership for Arts and Culture. *Northeast Ohio's Arts & Culture Plan*. Ohio: Community Partnership for Arts and Culture, 2000. Available at <http://www.cultureplan.org/news.html>.

Department of Community Development and Applied Economic, The University of Vermont, et. al. *The Impact of the Tourism Sector on the Vermont Economy: The Input-Output Model*. Vermont, 2001. Available at http://snr.uvm.edu/vtdc/publications/tourism_impact.pdf.

Godfrey, Kerry and Jackie Clarke. *The Tourism Development Handbook: A Practical Approach to Planning and Marketing*. London: Cassell, 2000.

Inskip, Edward. *Tourism Planning: An Integrated and Sustainable Development Approach*. New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1991.

John S. and James L. Knight Foundation. *Marketing the Arts: Lessons from a Community Marketing Collaboration*. Florida: Knight Foundation, 1999.

Lindall, Scott A. and Douglas C. Olson, *The IMPLAN Input-Output System*, Minnesota: MIG Inc., nd.

Lord Cultural Resources Planning & Management Inc. *Cultural Tourism: Trends and Expectations Between Tourism and Culture*. Proceeding of the Tourism 2000 Conference. Corning, NY. October 2000.

McKinsey & Company, *You Gotta Have Art: Profile of a Great Investment for New York State*. New York: New York State Council on the Arts and the City of New York Department of Cultural Affairs, 1997.

Michigan State University, Department of Park, Recreation and Tourism Resources. *Economic Impact Concepts*. Available at <http://www.msu.edu/course/prr/840/econimpact/index.htm>, last visited April 5, 2002.

NGA Center for Best Practices. *The Role of the Arts in Economic Development*. Issue Brief, June 25, 2001.

New York Foundation for the Arts. *Culture Counts: Strategies for a More Vibrant Cultural Life for New York City*. New York: New York Foundation for the Arts, 2001. Available at <http://www.nyfa.org/culturalblueprint/culturecounts.htm>.

Pennsylvania Economy League. *Greater Philadelphia's Competitive Edge: The Nonprofit Culture Industry and its Economic Value to the Region – A Report to the Regional Arts and Culture Economic Initiative*. Pennsylvania: Regional Arts and Culture Economic Initiative, 1998. Available at http://www.peleast.org/images/Arts_report.PDF.

Regional Cultural Plan Steering Committee. *Strategies for Regional Arts and Cultural Development in Greater Vancouver: A Report of the Regional Cultural Plan Steering Committee*. British Columbia, Canada, 1999. Available at <http://www.city.vancouver.bc.ca/commsvc/socialplanning/oca/Region/strategies.pdf>.

Stynes, Daniel J. *Economic Impacts of Tourism: A Handbook for Tourism Professionals*. Ed. Vanessa Arnold, Tourism Research Laboratory. Illinois: Tourism Research Laboratory at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1997.

The New England Council. *The Creative Economy Initiative: A Blueprint for Investment in New England's Creative Economy*. Boston: The New England Council, 2001. Available at http://www.nefa.org/creativeeconomy/creative_economy_2001.pdf.

Urness, Tiffany. *Determining the Return on Investment from Destination Marketing*. California: California Division of Tourism, nd.

Wendorf, Geoffrey. *Community Development Strategies for Tourism*. Wisconsin: Cooperative Extension Publications, nd.

Wessex Group, Ltd. *The Economic Impact of Arts and Cultural Organizations in Virginia*. Virginia: Virginians for the Arts, 2000. Available at <http://www.vaforarts.org/pdfs/Wessex.pdf>.

Wolf, Keens & Company. *Strengthening Culture: A Cultural Plan for Mobil*. Alabama: Mobile Arts Council, 2001. Available at <http://www.mobilearts.org/html/summary.php>.

Appendix F: **Endnotes**

-
- ¹ D.K. Shifflet & Associates Ltd. *Greater Niagara Region, New York State, Top Line Overnight Leisure Travel Profile: Year 2000*.
- ² Partners in Tourism and the Travel Industry Association of America 2001. *Partners in Tourism: Cultural and Commerce*. According to this report, 65 percent of American adult travelers say they included a cultural, arts, heritage or historic activity or event while on a trip of 50 miles or more one-way, in 2000.
- ³ OCG, *A Blueprint for Marketing Niagara County as a Visitor Destination*, 2002 (prepared under a contract with the University of Niagara).
- ⁴ Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau, Inc., *Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau, Inc. 2002 Marketing Plan*, 2002.
- ⁵ Shibley, Robert and Bradshaw Hovey, eds., *A Canal Conversation: Buffalo, New York*, New York: The Urban Design Project, 2001.
- ⁶ Erie County; Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County; Buffalo Niagara Convention & Visitors Bureau Inc.; Niagara County; Niagara Council of the Arts and Empire State Development Corporation WNY Region, *Memorandum of Understanding Regarding the Establishment of a Regional Tourism Program*, 2001.
- ⁷ Arts Council in Buffalo and Erie County, Regional Cultural Tourism Program, *Regional Cultural Tourism Program: Tactical Plan-2001-2003*, 2002.
- ⁸ Trahan, Burden & Charles, Inc., *A Report on Regional Tourism for Western New York State*, 1987 (prepared for The Western New York State Economic Development Corporation).
- ⁹ Buffalo Place, Inc., City of Buffalo, GBNRTC, and NFTA, *Cars Sharing Main Street: Staff Analysis*, 2001.
- ¹⁰ City of Buffalo, *Scajaquada Corridor Study*, available at www.ci.buffalo.ny.us/document_940.html, last visited March 26, 2002.
- ¹¹ City of Buffalo, *PowerPoint Presentation for the First Public Information Meeting*, available at www.ci.buffalo.ny.us/Files/1_2_1/Scajaquada/sld005.htm, last visited March 26, 2002.
- ¹² Research Resolutions & Consulting Ltd., *Cross-Border Cultural Tourism – A Two Way Street*, 2001.
- ¹³ State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Architecture and Planning, *Niagara Park, North America: A Binational Strategy for Attracting the World*, 1995.
- ¹⁴ Shibley, Robert and Bradshaw Hovey, eds., *Rethinking the Niagara Frontier: A report on the continuing bi-national forum*, New York: The Urban Design Project and the Waterfront Regeneration Trust, 2001.
- ¹⁵ Give a Shout for Chautauqua, a Student in Free Enterprise (SIFE) Team at the State University of New York College at Fredonia, *1999 Chautauqua County Tourism Conversion and Marketing Study*, 1999 (prepared for the Chautauqua County Visitors' Bureau).
- ¹⁶ Moriyama & Teshima Planners Limited, *Ontario's Niagara Parks: Planning the Second Century: A 100-year vision, a 20-year plan and a five-year action plan*, 1988 (prepared for The Niagara Parks Commission).
- ¹⁷ Seaway Trail, Inc., *Seaway Trail, Inc. Action Plan II*, 1996.
- ¹⁸ Seaway Trail, Inc., *Tourism Development Plan for the New York State Seaway Trail*, 1988.
- ¹⁹ Seaway Trail, Inc., *Seaway Trail Action Plan*, 1989.
- ²⁰ Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation, *Ontario's Overnight Visitors with an Outdoors Interest*, 1999, 2001.
- ²¹ Tourism Company, *Packaging Handbook for Tourism Suppliers*, 2000 (prepared for Ontario Tourism Marketing Partnership).
- ²² Canadian Tourism Commission, Industry and Product Development Committee, Cultural and Heritage Tourism Sub-Committee, *Packaging the Potential: A Five Year Business Strategy for Cultural and Heritage Tourism in Canada*, 1999.
- ²³ Malone Given Parsons Ltd., *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: A Self-guided Workbook*, 2001 (prepared for the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation, Investment & Development Office).
- ²⁴ Malone Given Parsons Ltd., *Premier-ranked Tourist Destinations: An Evaluation Framework and Its Testing in the South Georgian Bay Region*, 2001 (prepared for the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation, Investment & Development Office).
- ²⁵ Lang Research Inc., *Travel Activities and Motivations Survey – Cultural and Entertainment Segmentation Report*, 2001, available at www.tourism.gov.on.ca/english/tams/pdf/culture_ent.pdf, last visited April 8, 2002.
- ²⁶ There is no standard definition of "cultural tourism." Rather, definitions are wide ranging. Examples include: "Cultural tourism embodies all of the natural, cultural and historic resources that an area has to offer." Trahan, Burden & Charles, Inc., *A Report on Regional Tourism for Western New York State*, 1987, at 2. According to another report, "Cultural and heritage tourism occurs when participation in a cultural or

heritage activity is a significant factor for traveling.” Canadian Tourism Commission, Industry and Product Development Committee, Cultural and Heritage Tourism Sub-Committee, *Packaging the Potential: A Five Year Business Strategy for Cultural and Heritage Tourism in Canada*, 1999, at 2. The City of Indianapolis defines cultural tourism as “an economic strategy for attracting and/or extending the stay of visitors through marketing and development of artistic, heritage or historical offerings.” City of Indianapolis, *The Indianapolis Cultural Development Initiative: Building Participation Through Cultural Tourism*, 2001, at 3. In drafting a definition for this region, care should be taken to ensure that it reflects the plan’s goals. For example, if increasing the number of “new dollars” spent in the region is a goal of the plan, then the definition of cultural tourism should distinguish between local residents and persons living outside the region since spending by local residents generally does not represent new dollars to a region. Michigan State University, Department of Park, Recreation and Tourism Resources, *Economic Impact Concepts*, available at www.msu.edu/course/prr/840/econimpact/index.htm.